



**OFFICE OF THE GENERAL SECRETARY**

Unrepresented  
Nations and Peoples  
Organization

The Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO) would like to stress that the report here presented is a *draft* version of the final report.

This *draft* report will be presented to the Government of Rwanda, including the government representatives met by the mission, thus allowing discussion of the findings, conclusions and recommendations made by the UNPO mission.

The Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization welcomes any suggestions and/or comments by the Government of Rwanda. Possible comments will be taken up in a final report to be published later.

## Table of contents

### List of abbreviations

I	Introduction
II	Aims, objectives and activities of the mission
III	Composition of the mission
IV	Itinerary of the mission
V	Persons met by the mission
VI	Findings
A	The Batwa : background
B	Overall political situation in Rwanda, 1950's-1990
C	Developments 1950's-1990 ; Batwa perspective
D	1990 : RPF military operation in Rwanda
E	1990 : RPF operation in Rwanda ; Batwa perspective
F	April 1994, genocide and its aftermath
G	Genocide and war ; Batwa perspective
H	Current after-war situation in Rwanda
I	After-war situation : Batwa perspective
J	Situation in the refugee camps outside Rwanda
K	Refugee camps ; Batwa perspective
L	Situation in the displaced persons camps in Rwanda
M	Displaced persons camps ; Batwa perspective
N	The international community and the Batwa question
O	Overall needs of the Rwandan population
P	Specific needs of the Batwa
Q	Support of the Rwandan Government
R	Proposed projects for the upliftment of the Batwa
VII	Conclusions and recommendations
VIII	Second phase UNPO Batwa project

### Appendices

- i. List of prefectures, towns, communes, sectors and cells, visited by the mission
- ii. Letters in support of the UNPO Rwanda mission by the Rwandan government and prefectural authorities

Notes

## List of abbreviations

ABPR	Association of the Progressive Batwa of Rwanda
ACIST	African Community Support Teams
ADBR	Association for the Development of the Batwa of Rwanda
Adigmar	Association for the Integrated Development of the Marginalized Groups in Rwanda
APB	Association for the Promotion of Batwa
APGD	Association for the Promotion of the Disadvantaged Groups
APSD	Association for the Social Progress of the Disadvantaged
ARC	American Refugee Committee
Aredetwa	Association for the Democratic Restoration of the Twa
CDR	Coalition for the defence of the Republic
CLADHO	Collective of Human Rights Liges and Associations
IFRC	International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LWF	Lutheran World Federation
MDR	Democratic Republican Movement
MNRD	National Republican Movement for Democracy
MSF	Médecins sans Frontières (Doctors without Borders)
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
PIDP	Project for the Integration and Development of the Pygmies
PIM	Project for the Integration of the Mutwa
PL	Liberal Party
PSD	Social Democratic Party
Pygasse	Assistance to the Pygmies and the Environment
RAF	Rwandan Armed Forces
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
RTL	Free Radio Television Mille Collines
Seipy	Health and Education for all, Assistance for the Pygmies
UNAMIR	United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children and Education Fund
UNPO	Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization
UNREO	United Nations Rwanda Emergency Office

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

In July 1994, Charles Uwiragiye, Executive Secretary<sup>1</sup> of the Association pour la Promotion des Batwa (APB<sup>2</sup>), left Rwanda and managed to reach Geneva, where he attended the meeting of the UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations.

Charles Uwiragiye had miraculously survived the war and the genocidal terror in Rwanda that broke out in April 1994. His name was on the target lists of people to be killed. During April and May 1994, Charles Uwiragiye and his family hid for several weeks in an abandoned house in the rural suburbs of Kigali. Eventually they were evacuated by troops of the Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) and brought to a displaced persons camp in the north of Rwanda.

In Geneva the international community learned for the first time about the fate of the indigenous Batwa of Rwanda during this bleak period in Rwanda's history. Based on his personal experiences during the genocidal terror and the civil war, Charles Uwiragiye feared that up to 70% of the Batwa community might have perished in the period from April to July 1994. However, as he did not have the full picture of what had happened in other parts of the country, Charles Uwiragiye stressed the need of sending a fact finding mission to Rwanda to investigate what remained of the various Batwa communities scattered around the country.

After attending the UN meetings in Geneva, Charles Uwiragiye travelled to The Netherlands, to visit the International Secretariat of the Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO). With the help of UNPO, Charles Uwiragiye travelled through Europe, visiting several NGOs and government representatives to inform them on the situation in Rwanda in general and, more specifically, on the position of the Batwa.

UNPO is an organization of nations and peoples which are not adequately represented in international organizations such as the United Nations. UNPO was founded in 1991 and has currently 48 members (including supporting members). The Batwa of Rwanda have been member of UNPO since January 1993 ; represented in the organization by the Association for the Promotion of Batwa (APB).

At the request of APB, UNPO sent a mission to Rwanda and neighbouring countries, Zaire, Tanzania and Burundi. The mission travelled and worked in the region from October 3 until December 20, 1994.

The UNPO investigation mission to Rwanda was made possible by the financial support of the Netherlands Ministry of Development, Novib, Cebemo and the World Council of Churches.

## **II. AIMS, OBJECTIVES AND ACTIVITIES OF THE MISSION**

The mandate of the UNPO mission was as follows :

- to engage in fact finding activities in order to gather first hand information from the local population, refugees, government representatives, local authorities, relief workers etc.,with

respect to the number, specific situation and needs of the Batwa in Rwanda and neighbouring countries. The mission specifically focused on needs in terms of emergency relief, repatriation, rehabilitation and structural development aid ;

- to prepare recommendations for ways to meet those needs ;
- to publish the findings, conclusions and recommendations of the mission in a report.

### **III. COMPOSITION OF THE MISSION**

The UNPO members of the mission were :

- Ms Pauline Overeem, Co-Director of the Urgent Action Unit, UNPO ;
  - Ms. Erica A. Zwaan, Co-Director of the Urgent Action Unit, UNPO ;
  - Dr. Michael C. van Walt van Praag, General Secretary of UNPO, joined the mission from November 16 to 24, 1994.
- Mr. Charles Uwiragiye took part in the mission on behalf of the Association pour la Promotion des Batwa (APB), as the Executive Secretary that organization.

The Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO) was founded by representatives of occupied nations, indigenous peoples, minorities and other disenfranchised peoples who currently struggle to preserve their cultural identities, protect their basic human and economic rights, safeguard the environment or to regain their lost countries. These peoples are not represented in established international forums such as the United Nations. UNPO is a unique organization set up and run by the member peoples from all continents, in order to empower themselves and to participate in the international community.

One of the principal objectives of UNPO is the promotion of non-violent methods for the resolution of disputes involving nations and peoples and the advancement of their legitimate rights and aspirations by peaceful, diplomatic methods. In this regard UNPO has a unique potential to contribute to the prevention of violent conflict. The organization is in a favourable position to detect early signs of tensions and potential conflict, since it deals with the people and the movements who are often at the centre of controversial issues involving political, cultural or economic rights of minorities and peoples. Equally important, UNPO is one of the very few organizations many of the leaders of these populations trust, because it is *their* organization.

Not only does UNPO constitute a legitimate international forum for unrepresented nations and peoples, it also provides many services, including assistance in obtaining access to UN bodies, training programs in diplomacy, legal advice, training and assistance with respect to human rights, democracy, media relations and non-violence strategies, research, conflict prevention and conflict resolution services, assistance in strategic planning, election and referendum monitoring, educational internships and assistance in cultural preservation and promotion.

UNPO is for many of its member nations and peoples the principal channel of communication to the international community. The UNPO Secretariat provides means to its members to keep governments, international organizations, NGOs and the media informed of their

situations as they see them. At the same time, UNPO gives governments, the UN and others a rare opportunity to meet with or hear the views of legitimate representatives of peoples and minorities they might otherwise not have access to.

Founded in 1991, UNPO experienced a rapid growth. From the original 15 founding members, UNPO currently has over 40 members. In its first four years of operation, it held four General Assemblies as well as numerous special and regional conferences on subjects of vital importance to its members. Always, these conferences have brought the UNPO members together with government representatives and other international actors.

UNPO is recipient of the 1991 Tolerance Award, the 1992 International Social Invention Award and 1992 the World Gratitude Day Award. In 1993 UNPO was nominated for the Nobel Peace Prize and the Right Livelihood Award. UNPO was short listed for the Right Livelihood Award in 1994-'95.

#### **IV. ITINERARY OF THE MISSION**

In Rwanda, the mission<sup>3</sup> visited areas where the Batwa lived before April 1994. The mission travelled to Kigali, Byumba, Gitarama, Butare, Gikongoro, Kibuye, Gisenyi and Kibungo prefectures<sup>4</sup>. In Rwanda, in Gikongoro prefecture, the mission visited two displaced persons camps, Cyanika and Rukondo. The mission also visited refugee camps in the neighbouring countries. In Zaire the mission travelled to Goma and Bukavu regions. In north Kivu, the mission visited Mugunga, Katale, Kibumba and Jomba refugee camps and the Zairese village of Kaswa, where a considerable number of Batwa refugees had settled. In South Kivu, the mission visited Bukavu town and Katana village. In Burundi, the mission travelled to Bujumbura to meet with representatives of a local Batwa organization and aid organizations. The mission visited Magara refugee camp in Ngozi province. In Tanzania, the mission visited Benaco refugee camp, close to the town called Ngara. Due to the security situation, it was not possible to visit other refugee camps in Tanzania.

#### **V. PERSONS MET BY THE MISSION**

In Rwanda, the mission met with Batwa of all walks of life throughout the country, and with representatives of APB and other Batwa organizations. UNPO specifically wishes to thank Mr. Charles Uwiragiye, at the time Executive Secretary of APB ; Mr. Zéphyrin Karimba, at the time President of APB ; Mr. Gérard Seruvumba ; Mr. Claver Ndayambaje ; Mr. Tharcisse Gakuba ; Mr. Abdu Safari ; Mr. Jean Damascene Munyantore, all members of APB ; and Mr. Gaspard Sebalinda, legal representative of the Association pour le Développement Global des Batwa du Rwanda (ADBR<sup>5</sup>) ; and Mr. Laurent Munyankunge, member of ADBR ; for their contributions to the success of this mission.

The mission met with Government representatives, including H.E: Seth Sendasonga, Minister of Interior and Communal Developpement ; H.E. Alphonse Marie Nkubito, Minister of Justice ; H.E. Patrick Mazimhaka, Minister of Youth and Co-operatives ; H.E. Celestin Rwigema, Minister of Primary and Secondary Education ; Mr. Murara, General Director of the Ministry of Rehabilitation ; and Mr. Murekezi, General Director of the Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock.

The mission visited the three main prisons of the country in Kigali, Butare and Gitarama, and met with several prison administrators, including Mr. Sinayobye, Director of Kigali Central Prison. The mission met with Mr. Nsanzuwera, the prosecutor ; several local civil authorities, including Mr. Asiel Kabera, Prefect of Kibuye prefecture ; Mr Felix Bigirinshuti, Prefect of Gikongoro prefecture ; and military leaders.

The mission had meetings with representatives of international aid organizations, including among others Médecins sans Frontières, International Red Cross Commitee, Disaster Relief Agency, Lutheran World Federation, ACIST, Action Nord Sud, Oxfam UK, and Citizens Network, Reporters sans Frontières ; and with representatives of specialized United Nations agencies, such as of the UNREO and UNHCR branches in different parts of the country and UNICEF. The mission met with Mr. William Clarence, head of the UN Human Rights Field Operation in Rwanda and exchanged views and information with a number of UN Human Rights Monitors, including Mr. Mario Ibarra. The mission met with representatives of local of Rwandan human rights organizations, including Mr. Jean Paul Biramvu of the Rwandan human rights organization CLADHO, and Veneranda Nzambazammariyal of the Rwandan women's organization Réseau des Femmes. Further, the mission met with representatives of the Church and the international press.

In Zaire, Burundi and Tanzania, the mission visited a number of refugee camps, where a considerable part of the Batwa population of Rwanda has fled to since April 1994. The mission met with representatives of the Batwa communities in the refugee camps, local pygmy organizations, representatives of international aid organizations, such as Médecins sans Frontières, Care, Caritas International, Concern and Oxfam Quebec ; UN agencies, such as UNHCR, UNREO and UNICEF ; and the international press.

UNPO wishes to thank the Rwandan Government, the Batwa community, APB leaders, members of other Batwa organizations, Rwandans from all walks of life, representatives of international organizations and international and local NGOs and the Netherlands Government for their invaluable assistance and constructive co-operation.

## **VI: Findings**

### **A: The Batwa : background**

The Batwa are the indigenous inhabitants of Rwanda. Although it is not known when the Batwa first settled in Rwanda, or where they originally came from, it is indisputable that they lived in Rwanda before the Bahutu and subsequently the Batutsi settled there. The Batwa of Rwanda are related to other pygmy peoples in Central Africa, such as the Batwa of Burundi, the Bambouti of north-east Zaire and the pygmies of the Central African Republic and Congo.

The Batwa are only to a limited extent recognisable by their physical distinctiveness. In linguistic and religious respects the differences among Batwa, Bahutu and Batutsi are negligible. All *Banyarwanda* (Rwandans) speak *Kinyarwanda* (Rwandese). However, the Batwa stand out for their cultural distinctiveness. Batwa tradition is rich in songs, dance and music, and has been kept alive until today. Cultural gatherings are firmly integrated in the social life of the Batwa.

Originally the Batwa were forest dwellers, who provided in their living by hunting and collecting. As the forests were cleared in the course of the past centuries, the Batwa were forced to look for new places to settle and other sources of income. Nowadays, the Batwa of Rwanda can roughly be divided into two groups : the semi-nomadic Batwa of the forest and the sedentary Batwa.

According to APB, before April 1994, there were only some 3.000 forest Batwa left, clinging to their traditional way of life, and about 26.000 sedentary Batwa<sup>6</sup>. Bahutu farmers and Batutsi cattle herders have claimed the forests for their activities, and have pushed the Batwa aside. This process continues today. The existence of the only two forests of Rwanda, Nyungwe and Gishwati, or what remains of them, is threatened. Gishwati forest, in Gisenyi prefecture, was cleared in the early eighties for tea plantations and pasture, as required by the World Bank. As there was no re-settlement program for the forest Batwa, or *Impunyu*, the majority of the indigenous inhabitants of the forest were left to beg by the road side and were dispersed all over the country. Many among the poorest Batwa of Kigali, originally came from Gishwati. These people should be considered economic refugees in their own country. As it is, there is no hope for these people to return. Some half hearted efforts were undertaken to introduce the forest Batwa to agriculture, but these were not successful. In Kanombe sector (Kanama commune, Gisenyi prefecture), the UNPO mission visited an *Impunyu* community, barely surviving on the fringes of what used to be Gishwati forest. The Batwa inhabitants of Kanombe explained that the Batwa of Kanombe had been living in this place for generations. However, when their parents were young, there still was game in the forest. Today, the only thing that the Batwa could find in the forest was a type of reed, that they used to make mats. They demonstrated a rare sense of ecological responsibility, stressing the detrimental effects for the environment of felling old trees in the forest. Therefore, they claimed to only gather undergrowth or second generation wood. As a result, the Batwa here did not enjoy the use of charcoal. The 25 Batwa families survived by working as day labourers on the fields of the Bahutu in the area or as porters in the market.

In a report, the World Rainforest Movement estimates that in 1993 there were still some 500-2000 *Impunyu* in Nyungwe forest, in Cyangugu and Gikongoro prefectures. Unlike Gishwati, Nyungwe was still populated by wild life. However, a ban was imposed to prevent the Batwa from hunting and collecting in the forest. Although presented as an environmental protective

measure, there is no obvious ecological reason for this ban. By contrast, encroaching tea plantations, the construction of roads, illegal gold mining and the frequent use of the forest as military training ground, do seriously threaten the survival of the forest, and endanger the position of the Batwa in Nyungwe<sup>7</sup>.

Even among Batwa, the *Impunyu* are often looked down upon. Batwa refugees from Ruhengeri prefecture, with whom the mission met in Goma, told that their ancestors came from Gishwati forest, but they hastened to stress that they could not be considered real *Impunyu*. According to these respondents, the *Impunyu* are dirty and uncivilized as « they do not even wear clothes ».

Batwa live dispersed over Rwanda, in small communities, often at the periphery of mixed communes. Some larger concentrations of Batwa can be found in Byumba, Kibungo and Gitarama prefectures. The sedentary Batwa by and large adopted pottery as their main source of income. Besides pottery, Batwa made a living as entertainers (dancers and singers) at the courts of the Batutsi kings and elite, in the past. The Batwa are known for their skills and artistic talents in pot making. However, the local market for traditional water vessels and cooking pots is on the decline, due to the availability of cheap and durable plastic and aluminium products.

The Batwa form an isolated and marginalized group in Rwandan society. Tradition holds that Batwa are dirty, backward and stupid. In the course of time, social segregation became institutionalized, not allowing for any substantial contact between Batwa, on the one hand, and Bahutu and Batutsi, on the other. The main source of income was pottery. A few respondents interviewed by the mission mentioned that they owned cattle, which indicates that they were better off than the average Batwa. In one case, a respondent mentioned that his family had, in the old days, additional income from performing as entertainers at the Batutsi court.

However, in all cases it was stressed that discrimination against Batwa was rampant. No Mutwa child attended school beyond the third grade of primary school, as access was simply blocked.

Bahutu and Batutsi avoid eating together with Batwa ; a cup or plate may not be touched by others after it was used by a Mutwa ; Batwa can not use public water wells. In disputes concerning the use of communal lands, the Batwa more often than not have to give in. Batwa are often impeded their access to clay groves or swamps, as (Bahutu) farmers successfully claim the land for cultivating their crops. As clay is vital for the economic survival of the Batwa, and land is scarce in Rwanda, this often leads to violent clashes. Only very few Batwa possess land, and legally recognized land titles are even more rare.

The economic and political integration of the Batwa in Rwandan society is therefore extremely limited. Besides pottery, Batwa work as day labourers on Bahutu owned plantations. Many Batwa rely on what they earn by begging. Very few Batwa have paid jobs. Lack of income prevents the Batwa from paying their taxes ; penalized, they often end up in jail. Due to their low social status, Batwa have difficulty with access to education, health care, employment, media, information, housing etc.. Subsequently, the illiteracy rate among Batwa is considerably

higher than the national level. Batwa are not politically represented. In short, the Batwa form a disadvantaged and extremely vulnerable group within Rwandan society.

## **B. Overall political developments in Rwanda 1950's - 1990**

Western colonial domination over Rwanda was formalized in 1896, when Germany took over the external relations of the Rwandan (Batutsi) kingdom. In 1916, Belgium occupied Rwanda in its war campaign against Germany. After World War I, Germany had to give up its colonies and, in 1926, the League of Nations assigned Belgium the trusteeship over Rwanda. Belgian colonial policies in Rwanda fostered the powerful position of the Batutsi king and elite. The people, be it Bahutu (who formed an overwhelming majority), Batutsi or Batwa, had no influence on their rulers.

In the years 1959-1961, the Rwandan society went adrift and a social and political revolution took place. The process of political emancipation of the majority Bahutu led to the abolishment of the Batutsi monarchy. The Belgian rulers assisted in this process, in an effort to be pragmatic. In 1961, Belgium withdrew from Rwanda and the independent Republic of Rwanda was proclaimed with the Bahutu in power.

One of the more serious consequences of these developments was the exodus of Batutsi, who fled the country in subsequent waves, to escape recurring Bahutu violence. Between 1959 and 1973 Batutsi fled to Uganda, Zaire, Tanzania and Burundi, bringing the total amount of refugees to 600,000 in the early nineties<sup>8</sup>. From December 1963 until 1967, the exiles launched military attacks on the border regions. Officially the Government welcomed the exiles to return, but gross government sponsored discrimination and large scale massacres carried out by the Bahutu dominated government and army against the Batutsi in Rwanda prevented the refugees from returning. In 1973, the year that general Yuvenal Habyarimana took over power in a military coup, the government changed its policy, and the exiles were, also officially, no longer welcome.

In 1978, by law, every Rwandan citizen became member of the only party, the National Revolutionary Movement for Development (MNRD). The iron grip of the MNRD on the country tightened and the economic, social and political crisis worsened. The Rwandan economy depended on the export of tea and coffee ; confronted with decreasing world market prices, harsh World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) policies, western protectionism and drought, the economy collapsed. Pressure of population growth, land scarcity and an unequal distribution of land and wealth aggravated the situation. The corrupt, totalitarian state had no remedy for this crisis. Those criticizing the government faced intimidation, arbitrary arrest or worse. The people were kept ignorant, unaware of their rights and were consequently easy to manipulate.

However, in the summer of 1990, influenced by a wind of political change that touched Africa, some steps in the direction of multi-partism and democratization were taken, at the initiative of president Habyarimana.

## **C: Developments 1950's-1990 ; Batwa perspective**

In the days of the Batutsi monarchy, a small segment of the Batwa community of Rwanda had attained a somewhat privileged position at the courts of the king and the Batutsi elite. They had found employ as entertainers, and in isolated cases, as executioners. Some of them were bestowed privileges by the Batutsi rulers, as a sign of the latter's gratitude for their services. As a result, some Batwa families possessed land and cattle and, to a certain extent, adapted to the Batutsi life style. However, it should be stressed that the majority of the Batwa, like the majority of the Bahutu and Batutsi, were living in a state of near slavery.

Generally speaking, the Batwa played a marginal role in the political and social life in Rwanda ; there were hardly any Batwa involved in the revolutionary changes of 1959-1961. In those days, only very few Batwa attended school, and even fewer Batwa had paid jobs or any position in society. However, in the wake of the political emancipation of the Rwandan population, some Batwa took the initiative to form a political party. The Association pour le Relèvement Démocratique des Twa, AREDETWA<sup>9</sup>, was founded on July 1, 1960. Laurent Munyankuge was one of the founders. The UNPO mission spoke extensively with him, recalling the events of that period. The aim of AREDETWA was to improve the position of the Batwa and to enhance the level of political participation. According to Munyankuge, the Batutsi elite thwarted Batwa (and other) emancipation efforts. AREDETWA therefore maintained close relations with other new political parties, such as Aprosoma/Parmehutu, the party of the first president of independent Rwanda Gregoire Kayibanda. The Belgian colonial rulers approved of the foundation of AREDETWA. Already in 1962, AREDETWA merged into Parmehutu, the main Bahutu party that had taken the lead after the demise of the Batutsi monarchy. Parmehutu is the precursor of today's MNRD. According to Munyankuge, a merge in the majority Bahutu party had become necessary to defend Batwa rights more effectively. From 1962 until November 1965, Munyankuge served as deputy for Parmehutu in the Rwandan National Assembly. In the entire period from 1965 until 1990, there was no political representation of the Batwa whatsoever. AREDETWA had died a silent death, and with Munyankuge leaving the political scene in 1965, no single Mutwa played a role of any significance in the political developments within the country.

In the period 1959-1973, subsequent waves of repression forced hundreds of thousands of Batutsi to flee the country. With them, thousands of Batwa sought refuge in the neighbouring countries. There are no reliable figures with respect to the percentage of Batwa among the exile communities in the surrounding countries.

The UNPO mission spoke with a number of Batwa families who recently returned to Rwanda, after having passed about 35 years in exile in Uganda.

A summary of their reasons for fleeing Rwanda at the time, gives the following picture : All the respondents were interviewed in Byumba prefecture, from where they, or their parents, originated. They all referred to the insecurity that prevailed in Rwanda in the period 1959-1962, as the main reason for leaving. They described the country as being in a state of civil war : people were killed, houses burnt down and properties looted. Even in exile, Batwa did not share in commodities of other villagers. Water or food touched by Batwa still did not change hands with Bahutu or Batutsi. Mutton was considered filthy and unhealthy, « because it was a dish eaten by Batwa ». Indeed, the Batwa entertainers had acquired a certain social status

but, nonetheless, they were not liked, either by Bahutu or by Batutsi. The Batwa who fled the country fled in small groups, together with other Batwa. They did not mingle with Batutsi during their flight nor upon arrival in Uganda.

Upon arrival in Uganda, the refugees were taken to camps in the middle of the mosquito ridden forests in the southern and western parts of Uganda. There was a general lack of food, clean water, medicine, clothes and construction materials. The education system was inaccessible for most refugees, because they could not pay the school fees. As the Batwa formed the poorest group among the refugees, they suffered even more.

In the camps, the refugees were grouped together according to their places of origin. As a result, the Batwa were dispersed over the camps. This was felt by Batwa as a disadvantage, as the Batwa were not in a position to stand up for their rights whenever these were violated. It often happened that Batwa did not get their due share of the commodities provided by the authorities. The distribution of the commodities was in the hands of leaders (often Church leaders) who favoured the Batutsi, and discriminated against the Batwa. Batwa were considered filthy and poor, and the other refugees tried to avoid them.

Of the Batwa *returnees* interviewed by the UNPO mission, there were very few who had dared to come back before the radical changes in the Rwandan political constellation in 1994. Still, the living conditions in exile in Uganda were appalling enough. Nevertheless, it was stressed by most Batwa *returnees*, that the degree of discriminatory behaviour had diminished, compared with the situation in Rwanda. As everybody was poor, the sharpest class distinctions had lost their sharp edges. The demise of the traditional administrative structure, including Batutsi kings and rulers, contributed to these social changes. For the majority of the Batwa in exile, pottery remained their main source of income. In some cases Batwa worked as day labourers for Ugandan plantation owners.

The Ugandan authorities and population displayed harsh behaviour towards the refugees ; when transferring refugees from one camp to another, they used to cane and beat people up. The Ugandan president Obote was on friendly terms with Kayibanda, Rwanda's first president. In 1963, Obote agreed to clear the southern most strip of Uganda of Rwandan refugees, to reduce the military incursions by the Rwandan refugees from Ugandan territory into Rwanda. When the Rwandan refugees were forcibly removed from the border area, however, no explanation was given. Many people had no clue what was going on. Again, it was especially the Batwa who suffered, as they were among the worst informed, lacking radios or other sources of information.

When war broke out between Uganda and Tanzania in 1979, tens of thousands of Rwandan refugees, among them many Batwa, moved from Uganda to Tanzania. Living conditions in Tanzania were awful, but at least more stable than in Uganda. In 1982, the situation of the Rwandan refugees in the camps in Uganda reached its lowest point, when Obote's troops and Ugandan civilians engaged in violent activities against the refugees, such as looting their properties, intimidation, kidnap, rape and killings. In 1982, many Rwandan refugees were forcibly expatriated to Rwanda, among them a considerable number of Batwa. Charles Uwiragiye, for example, returned to Rwanda with his family, after he had been attacked by

Obote's soldiers. In Rwanda, however, life was not easy for the returning refugees. The Uwiragiye family first settled in Byumba prefecture, but, due to the extremist political climate in the village, they could not stay and left for Kigali. Many Rwandans coming from Uganda, were chased out of Rwanda again. Among them were many Batwa.

Many Batwa talked with regret how they had difficulty in preserving Batwa tradition and culture in exile. Batwa had to adjust their pots and pipes to local Ugandan taste, abandoning old ways of decorating and modelling. Consequently, the second generation refugees partly lost the knowledge of other Batwa traditions, such as songs and dances, and, in some cases, their mother tongue.

In 1980-'81, the Association pour le Progrès Social des Batwa (APSB<sup>10</sup>) was formed, by Bahutu representatives of the Church in Butare prefecture, among whom a sister called Augustine. The aim of APSB was twofold : to develop the allegedly backward Batwa and to convert them to Christianity. In 1989, the association changed its name to Association pour le Progrès Social des Demunis (APSB<sup>11</sup>), shifting its focus from the Batwa to all marginalized groups in Rwandan society. APSD is currently inactive, as sister Augustine did not survive the war.

In 1984, the Association pour le Développement Intégré des Groupes Marginaux au Rwanda (ADIGMAR<sup>12</sup>) was formed. ADIGMAR was set up by a priest, and focused on the *Impunyu* (forest Batwa). Several high government and Church officials had seats in ADIGMAR's board, such as the late President Habyarimana, some ministers and the Archbishop of Kigali. As the Archbishop, an extremist Muhutu, also had a senior position in the MNRD, ADIGMAR was an instrument of the government of the time. ADIGMAR was a cover organization, applying for and receiving money ostensibly for noble ends. Money that mostly disappeared into the pockets of the leaders of the organization. Jean Pierre Godding (Caritas International) explained to the UNPO mission how land that ADIGMAR was supposed to distribute to a group of Batwa ended up in the hands of the military. Apart from Jean Damascene Kayombya (formerly ADIGMAR, now ADBR), no other Batwa were involved in either APSB or ADIGMAR.

#### **D. 1990 : RPF military operation in Rwanda**

On October 1, 1990, the Rwanda Patriotic Front (RPF) attacked Rwanda from the Ugandan border. The RPF troops consisted mainly of second generation exiles, born and brought up in Uganda. The objectives of the operation were, in the first place, to bring about a lasting solution for the refugee problem, forcing the Habyarimana government to create possibilities for them to return.

In a tense reaction to the RPF invasion, the Rwandan government ordered the arrest of about 10.000 Batutsi and political opponents and the first Batutsi were massacred. France and Belgium intervened militarily ; Belgium retreated after its expatriates were evacuated. The French military, however, stayed behind. The Habyarimana regime started an extensive military build up program, assisted by France.

In January 1991, RPF troops managed to open a second front in Byumba prefecture, in the north-east of Rwanda. The human and economic misery as a direct result of the war, should not be underestimated. The RPF operation activated deeply rooted Bahutu feelings of inferiority. The extremist Bahutu politicians and administrators readily abused these sentiments by sowing seeds of fear for and hatred of the Batutsi. Aware of the political chaos in Burundi, the Bahutu in Rwanda feared a Batutsi come back on the political scene.

In June 1991, a new constitution was adopted. As a follow up to the developments initiated in the summer of 1990, multi-partism was recognized and freedom of press guaranteed. Immediately, several political parties were created, such as the Democratic Republican Movement (MDR), the Liberal Party (PL) and the Social Democratic Party (PSD). In March 1992, extremist Bahutu formed the Coalition for the Defence of the Republic (CDR). Again Batutsi were massacred in South Rwanda. In April 1992, a new government was formed, including the MNRD, and the new opposition. The RPF was, however, excluded. The youth militia of the MNRD (known as *Interahamwe*<sup>13</sup>) engaged in violent manifestations. They were trained by the army, in the forests of Gishwati, Nyungwe and in military camps<sup>14</sup>.

The negotiations between the RPF and the Rwandan government, started in June 1992, resulted in the signing of the first peace accords, in Arusha, Tanzania. Both parties agreed upon a cease-fire. However, in November 1992, Habyarimana dismissed the accords as mere « paper work ». In December, again another massacre of Batutsi civilians took place in Gisenyi prefecture, the native area of President Habyarimana.

The vicissitudes in the position of the Habyarimana regime are partly explained by the fact that more extremist elements in the clique formed around Habyarimana's person slowly but certainly undermined his position. Representatives of Habyarimana's family, the presidential guard, the army, the police forces, the *Interahamwe* and, last but not the least, the media, tried to promote their own interests, often at the expense of the national good.

In January 1993, a new step in the process towards peace was taken ; the government and the RPF signed the second part of the protocol of the Arusha accords, which provided for the maintenance of the state of law, an end to the massacres, and the formation of a broad-based transition government, which would include the RPF. At the same time, however, the *Interahamwe* engaged in atrocities in Kigali and throughout the country. The RPF started a new offensive, that was stopped by government troops, with French military assistance, just outside Kigali. 750.000 to 1.000.000 peasants fled the war ridden area in north and north-east Rwanda and headed for Kigali. In the international media, the RPF was accused of summary executions of civilians in the areas controlled by them.

When the RPF prospects for victory in Rwanda improved, the resentment of the Ugandan population towards the Rwandan refugees in Uganda grew stronger.

During the first half of 1993, accords were reached and signed, arranging for a cease fire, the departure of foreign troops from Rwanda, the return of internally displaced persons, and the creation of an unified national army, including both the troops of the governmental Rwandan Armed Forces (RAF) as well as of the RPF. The RPF troops took up their positions of before

February 1993. A transitional government was installed in June 1993, led by Agathe Uwilingiyimana (MDR). But the RPF was again not included. Despite this, the overall Arusha peace treaty was signed by both parties in August 1993. To mark its discontent of the developments, an extremist Bahutu radio station (RTL) began broadcasting propaganda, agitating against the RPF and the Batutsi in general. The UNPO mission spoke with Batwa from Musambira commune (Gitarama prefecture) who fled their villages in February 1994 to escape the Bahutu militia who were already harassing and indiscriminately killing the population.

In December 1993, the United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda (UNAMIR) was established, and 600 RPF troops were installed in Kigali, to protect future RPF ministers and deputies in the government which was to be formed. Despite the circumspet progress made until that point, in January 1994, the implementation process of the Arusha accords was blocked, due to the total refusal of Bahutu extremists to continue with the creation of a broadly based transition government.

### **E. 1990 : RFP Operation in Rwanda ; Batwa perspective**

The grip of the totalitarian Habyarimana regime on the population was complete. The absence of a free, independent press aggravated the dependent position of the population. The Batwa in Rwanda were hardly politicized and badly informed about what was going on in the country. Many Batwa were illiterate and too poor to afford a radio. Few Batwa in Rwanda knew about the RPF and even about the war raging in the north-eastern part of Rwanda. In interviews, people often said that they did not know anything about politics. Due to their vulnerable socio-economic position, Batwa, suffered disproportionately from the negative effects of the war and the ethnic tensions that flared up as a result of the RPF military operation. In the eyes of many, Batwa were friends of the Batutsi, because of their former, often misinterpreted, links with the Batutsi court.

The Batwa benefited from the political liberalization carried out by the Habyarimana regime. During its mission in Rwanda, UNPO spoke with many people, piecing together the picture of the Batwa organizations in Rwanda.

In 1991, a number of Batwa got together with the view to create a Batwa organization. Some were in favor of creating a political party, others were convinced that a NGO was ambitious enough a project. Zéphirin Karimba, Tharcisse Kaguba, Claver Ndayambaje and Laurent Munyankuge met to discuss the alternative possibilities. The main obstacle in creating a political party, was a serious lack of funds. In November 1991, after APB was created, a delegation of Batwa met with president Habyarimana, sounding out the opinion of the regime. Habyarimana's message was clear : he would not approve of a political party by and for Batwa. However, he was willing to put money into a politically harmless NGO. However, Gérard Seruvumba, member of the Batwa delegation, stated that the Batwa were not corruptible, meaning that they would never accept money if it was not free of conditions. So, APB never received any money from the government. In August 1991, the Association pour la Promotion des Batwa (APB) was created, followed by the Association pour le

Développement Global des Batwa du Rwanda (ADBR) in January 1993, and the Association des Batwa Progressives du Rwanda (ABPR<sup>15</sup>) in February 1994.

APB's aims were to defend the rights and interests of the Batwa ; to act as intermediary for the Batwa community in its contacts with national and local authorities, and other benefactors ; to promote the socio-economic and political development of the Batwa, with the emphasis on primary health care, education and employment ; and to promote Batwa culture. One of founders of APB was François Munyeshuri. Munyeshuri had in United States, met with representatives of Native American organizations, and had outspoken ideas on the democratization and emancipation of the Batwa. Charles Uwiragiye joined APB shortly after it had been founded. APB linked up with the International Alliance of Indigenous-Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests, an international umbrella organization of indigenous peoples, and much time and effort was put in informing the international community of the existence and the fate of the Batwa of Rwanda. In January 1993, the Batwa, represented by the APB, were admitted as members of UNPO. During the 1993 UN International Year of Indigenous Peoples, APB organized meetings and manifestations in Kigali. In Kigali, a workshop was opened (carpentry for Batwa boys, sewing for Batwa girls), combining vocational training with income generating activities<sup>16</sup>.

Despite the enthusiastic take off, APB had to face serious starting problems. These problems can be summarized as follows : due to lack of experience of the APB administrators, the (financial) management of the organization was not set up very efficiently ; generally speaking there was a lack of transparency. The APB leadership was formed by a small nucleus of educated Batwa, some of whom were linked to each other by family ties. In the initial phase of its existence, APB focused mainly on the Batwa of Greater Kigali ; the Batwa in the more remote parts of the country were not immediately reached. Particularly the *Impunyu* were to some extent neglected as a target group. APB failed to engage in serious awareness raising on the grass roots level, despite the apparent need to do so. Fellow organizations of the francophone African region of the International Alliance of the Indigenous-Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests criticized APB for neglecting the co-ordination tasks<sup>17</sup>.

APB has been severely criticized for these initial failures. However, it is most important to realize under what (political) constraints APB was set up and with what kind of problems APB had to deal. First of all, in April 1994, when the entire country was subdued in terror and chaos, APB had only been in existence for two and a half years. Hardly enough time to get well organized. Secondly, APB suffered from a continuous lack of funds and depended largely on donations from foreign funders. Lack of communication and transportation in Rwanda make grass roots work very difficult. Many Batwa live completely isolated, not easily reached by car, let alone by phone. Further, it should be stressed that no other Batwa organization did any better!

The UNPO mission met with numerous Batwa who expressed their faith in APB and praised APB for the initiatives taken to improve their lives. For example in Ntongwe commune, Gitarama prefecture, where all the 587 Batwa who lived in the commune before April 1994 were members of APB. APB had played an active role intermediary in a dispute among the Batwa and their fellow villagers concerning the use of a certain swamp. APB managed to

secure the plot for the Batwa community, for the cultivation of sweet potatoes. In the same commune APB representatives successfully pressed Batwa parents to send their children to school, after arranging with the local school leaders that the poor Batwa were exempt from paying school fees.

In January 1993, some Batwa, who had been involved with APB since its creation, split off, and created ADBR. In focus and policy, there are few substantial differences between APB and ADBR, although ADBR demonstrated less interest in preserving the traditional heritage of the (forest) Batwa, stressing the importance for the Batwa community to adapt to modern life. A major difference between APB and ADBR is, however, that ADBR received support from the Habyarimana government, and co-operated with Adigmar. It does not seem to be an exaggeration to say that the Habyarimana government invested in ADBR to sabotage the work of APB and to ruin its reputation. In that sense, ADBR's mandate was a negative one to oppose APB. Although supported by powerful allies in the government, ADBR was not able to create a constructive alternative to APB. In fact, up until April 1994, ADBR, did not manage to get any project off the ground.

Another Batwa organization that was created was the Association des Batwa Progressives du Rwanda (ABPR). APB member of the first hour, Claver Ndayambaje, was the founder of ABPR. Due to lack of ideas, funds, support and to the outbreak of violence and war in April 1994, ABPR has still not undertaken any activities and Claver Ndayambaje told the UNPO mission he would probably not pursue the idea.

From December 1993 onwards, when rumours about the victories of the RPF reached the Rwandan refugees, an ever increasing number of Batwa refugees residing in Uganda decided to return to their motherland. Many among the Batwa refugees in Uganda supported the RPF, often only with token financial support.

## **F. April 1994, genocide and its aftermath**

On April 6, 1994, the presidents of Rwanda and Burundi were killed when their plane, returning from a regional summit in Dar-es-Salaam was shot down in flight. Until today it has not been determined precisely who was responsible for this attack, but everything points in the direction of the militant Bahutu extremists who disagreed with Habyarimana's « peace » policies and the Arusha accords concluded between the government and the RPF. Within hours of the crash, in the night of April 6, massacres started. The army, the *Interahamwe* and the presidential guard engaged in large scale killings. The following day, Prime Minister Agathe Uwilingiyimana (a Muhutu!) and ten Belgian UN *blue helmets* were among the first victims. All Batutsi were targeted, regardless of their age, gender, political affiliation. Bahutu and Batwa were massacred as well, depending on their political or social background.

The violence that followed the downing of the plane on April 6, can be described as genocide of the Batutsi population of Rwanda. An estimated one million Batutsi were cruelly slaughtered. Tens of thousands « moderate » Bahutu and thousands of Batwa were massacred. The Rwandan Armed Forces (RAF), the presidential guards, the police and the *Interahamwe*

were responsible for the unnameable crimes and were supported by some of the local population. It is said that possibility up to 80% of the Bahutu population participated in the killings.

Reacting to the unleashing of the massacres, the RPF launched an attack. The 600 RPF troops stationed in Kigali left their cantonment, and in the north of Rwanda RPF units were mobilized. On April 9, the governing parties formed a post-Habyarimana interim government, which the RPF refused to recognize. The government troops immediately closed off the borders with Zaire, Burundi and Tanzania ; Batutsi attempting to flee the country were awaited at the borders and massacred. Radio Télévision Libre Milles Collines (RTL) started calling upon the population to mobilize and attack all « Belgian and RPF elements ». The interim government used the services of RTL to call upon the people of Kigali to install road blocks, check people's identity cards and arrest or harass « hostile elements ».

Belgium and France sent troops to evacuate expatriates. In an incomprehensible manoeuvre, the UN Security Council decided to reduce the number of *blue helmets* from 2.500 to 270. Those who remained were bound by a limited mandate : to keep an eye on the implementation of the Arusha accords, and by no means use force. Apart from the 270 *blue helmets*, a number of UN military monitors (or : *milobs*) stayed behind. The departure of the UN troops and the limited international interference, contributed to a large extent to the fact that genocide could take place un-hindered. (Only on May 17, 1994, more than a month after the full scale genocide was unleashed, did the Security Council come to its senses and voted for the deployment of 5.500 *blue helmets* in Rwanda and imposed an arms embargo.)

In the third week of april, the RPF troops took Kigali airport. The UN High Commissioner for Human Rights sent a special Rapporteur, René Degni-Segui, to Rwanda, to investigate the violations of international humanitarian law. Zaire confirmed its support for the Rwandan interim government. By that time, UNICEF, Amnesty International and the International Red Cross estimated the number of victims at more than 100.000. Médecins sans Frontières spoke of more than 200.000 victims. The then Rwandan Minister of Foreign Affairs, in turn, accused the RPF of being responsible for the murder of 20.000-30.000 Bahutu in the northern part of Rwanda.

From April 28 onwards, Bahutu (mainly) civilians started to flee the country from advancing RPF. About a quarter of a million people fled to Tanzania, within 24 hours, according to UNHCR figures. The refugees feared the RPF who had taken over Kibungo prefecture. The troops of the Rwandan Armed Forces fled in the direction of Akagera national park ; on their flight, they fought, killed, destroyed and looted houses and buildings. On May 24, the UN Security Council adopted a resolution condemning the massacres of the Batutsi in Rwanda as genocide ; a special rapporteur was sent to Rwanda to investigate the massacres. At that moment, Rwanda happened to have a seat in the Security Council and the Rwandan Minister of Foreign Affairs was given the opportunity to deliver a most shameful statement, blaming the Batutsi for misery and war in Rwanda. In a report, the human rights organization African Rights criticized the UN for its inadequate action towards the Rwandan interim Government.

During these months, radio RTLM accused « Batutsi extremists » of having started the war in their hunger for power. The radio called upon the local authorities to distribute arms among the Bahutu population in order to enable them to defend themselves. Worse, RTLM called upon the population to actively kill the RPF rebels and all those who sympathized with their cause. Many people listened to these calls, took to the streets and participated in the genocide.

On June 8, the RPF announced that its troops had killed 3 bishops and 10 catholic priests in Kabgayi, among them the late Archbishop of Kigali.

In the beginning of June, the UN Security Council decided to authorize a French armed humanitarian intervention in Rwanda and to create a humanitarian zone to protect the local population and the internally displaced persons, the so-called *Zone Turquoise*, in the south-east of Rwanda, covering Kibuye, Cyangugu and Gikongoro prefectures. In this zone, the French were to collaborate with the same civilian authorities in the government controlled area who were responsible for the genocide. However in the *Zone Turquoise* the French managed to keep the militia away from the Batutsi camp Nyarushishi and to give the refugees a sense of security. The French mandate was limited : thousands of *Interahamwe* were arrested, but the French had to let them go as they were not entitled to keep people in detention. Later in June, a UN report was published, holding the Rwandan government and its allies responsible for the genocide of the Batutsi and large scale massacres of the Bahutu population.

On June 13, 1994, the RPF took Gitarama, where the interim government was seated. This did not mean an end to the horrors. On June 17, for example, the Bahutu militia attacked the Mille Collines Hotel in the centre of Kigali, where some 500 Batutsi refugees were hidden, protected by UN military. In the refugee camps in Burundi, Batutsi refugees were killed in their sleep by Bahutu militia. In Tanzania, the UNHCR was confronted by an angry mob of Bahutu refugees, protesting against the announced removal of a Bahutu militant from the camp. On July 4, the RPF took Kigali and Butare, after months of severe fighting. Thousands of peoples who had been in hiding for months, got to the streets to celebrate their liberation. In the newly taken areas, the RPF started summarily punishing those presumed guilty of participating in the genocide. The interim government meanwhile continued its hatred campaign, as a result of which the Bahutu population fled in great numbers. People fled for three reasons : out of fear for the RPF, a fear fed by the Bahutu militias ; to get away from the violence and the chaos of the war, or to escape punishment for their part in the genocide.

By the end of June, one of the last remaining front lines was close to Gikongoro. Millions of Bahutu were cornered in the *Zone Turquoise*.

From July 13 onwards, a massive exodus of Rwandans, mainly Bahutu, started, heading for Goma, Zaire. Living conditions in the growing refugee camps were awful. In the course of the next weeks thousands of refugees died of cholera. The size of the refugee population in Goma was estimated at around one million people. Food, clean drinking water, medecines, blankets, construction materials were, and still are, scarce. Transportation and security were most problematic. In the first week, 4.000 people died every day. Many of the refugees were weak upon arrival in Zaire, due to malnutrition, physical exhaustion or HIV infection.

Gisenyi, the last bastion of the government troops fell to the RPF on July 15, 1994. RAF soldiers and civilians had thoroughly looted the town. Everything that could possibly be taken away had been dragged off to the Rwandan refugee camps in Zaire. The government troops forced the remaining population to cross the Rwandan border into Zaire. The RPF declared the war to be over on July 17, and a new government of national unity was formed in Kigali on July 19, 1994. Several days later, the United States were the first to declare it no longer recognized the former Rwandan government. The new government, assisted by the UN, engaged in a campaign to convince the displaced persons in the *Zone Turquoise* of its good intentions and control over the situation in the country. However, many people refused to accept this message. The fact that the former government parties did not take part in the new government was resented, and the RPF was suspected and accused of revenge activities. It was feared that the departure of the French soldiers, who were responsible for law and order in the humanitarian zone, would provoke another massive exodus of Rwandans leaving for Zaire and Burundi. On August 22, the French ended their operation in the *Zone Turquoise*. The transfer of power by the French to the UN troops was most chaotic. The Ethiopian *blue helmets* were welcomed with a rain of stones ; many Bahutu took them to be related to the Batutsi and refused to accept their authority.

The security situation in the refugee camps in Zaire and Tanzania deteriorated rapidly : the Bahutu *Interahamwe*, the Zairese army and local bandits benefited from the vulnerable position of the refugees, stealing food destined for the refugee population. UNHCR described the situation as « a near state of war ».

### **G: Genocide and war ; Batwa perspective**

As explained above, the Batwa formed a particularly badly informed group in Rwandan society. Apart maybe from the APB members, the majority of the Batwa were not at all aware of the political tensions in the country. Hardly any Batwa had taken sides in the political struggle, or were at all involved in politics. Therefore, few Batwa were prepared for the dramatic developments that took place in the aftermath of April 6, 1994.

It is difficult to determine with any degree of accuracy how many Batwa died during the massacres and the war. In some villages visited by the UNPO mission, as many as 80% of the Batwa population were killed or were still missing. In some villages around half of the people survived, while in others again, communities lost fewer people<sup>18</sup>. However, it is obvious that the Batwa community was not spared in the massacres. Often the Batwa were targeted as sympathisers of the RPF, or, more generally, as « friends of the Batutsi ». The general perception of the Batwa as linked to the former Batutsi court, put the Batwa in the Batutsi/RPF camp. Moreover, the considerable involvement of the Burundese Batwa in dirty politics in that country, had earned the Batwa of Rwanda a bad reputation. In numerous cases, in communes spread all over the country, the UNPO mission was told that Batwa were threatened by *Interahamwe*, RAF troops, and the presidential guards. « First we will kill the Batutsi, then we will kill you », « your turn will come », were threats frequently heard and often carried out.

In Murambi commune (Byumba prefecture), Batwa told the UNPO mission how *Interahamwe* had attacked the village on April 7, killing Batutsi, moderate Bahutu and Batwa, ostensibly to revenge the death of president Habyarimana<sup>19</sup>. In Nyakayaga sector (Gituza commune, Byumba prefecture), only 25 Batwa, including children, remain out of a community that counted about 600 Batwa before April 1994. In Kanasi sector (Kanzenze commune, Kigali prefecture), some 30 persons, including children, remain out of an estimated Batwa population of more than 150 persons.

In Nyanza sector (Nyabusindi commune, Butare prefecture), the entire population of the commune had sought refuge for the war combat activities, after the arrival of the RPF. Twenty Batwa who ran into the arms of the *Interahamwe*, were accused of siding with the RPF and were killed. Then, in the panic of their approaching defeat, the *Interahamwe* killed in an effort to get rid of everyone who could accuse them of atrocities.

In Ntyazo commune (Gitarama prefecture), where RPF and RAF were engaged in severe fighting, a group of Batwa villagers, including small children, were stopped at a road block by *Interahamwe*, asked to present their ID cards and instantly killed when it became clear that they were Batwa.

Abdu Safari from Musasa commune (Kigali prefecture), related how he and his sister were specifically targeted by the local *Interahamwe* for their active involvement in village politics and links with the APB. Safari's sister was killed, he miraculously escaped.

On the basis of information gathered by the UNPO mission, it seems that almost all Batwa of Cyangugu prefecture were either killed or fled to Zaire. Alessandro Bolzoni (UNHCR) stated that Nyamasheke parish (Kagano commune) was one of the few villages where some Batwa remained.

In Nyaruhengeri, before April 1994 the second largest Batwa community of Butare prefecture, virtually no Batwa remained. All had fled to Burundi. Many for fear of revenge by fellow Batutsi villagers or RPF soldiers, for the crimes committed by others.

Many Batwa died, and many more would have been killed were it not for the intervention of RPF. Many respondents explained that they were saved from the hands of the *Interahamwe* when the latter, the RAF and their supporters among the population had to run for the arriving troops of the RPF. The *Interahamwe* just lacked time to finish their job.

It was not always easy to obtain accurate information. Many people were severely traumatized by the events, and had problems in recalling exactly what occurred. A complicating factor was that, due to lack of education, innumeracy is very prevalent among the Batwa communities, with the result that some Batwa failed to produce reliable figures. Moreover, the UNPO mission found that survivors could not always speak freely. During a group interview in Rusatira commune (Butare prefecture), for example, the Batwa did not dare to give details of the threats and atrocities of the *Interahamwe* in the presence of fellow Bahutu villagers<sup>19</sup>.

Batwa were not exclusively killed by *Interahamwe*, army and their supporters. Many Batwa died as a result of the acts of war, and many Batwa died in the hands of local, un-disciplined RPF soldiers in the early days of the RPF take over. The UNPO mission gathered a number of reports on killings and arbitrary arrests for which soldiers of the RPF were responsible.

Several incidents were reported to have taken place in Gitarama prefecture, especially in the first weeks of June 1994, after the RPF soldiers had occupied the region. It was reported that a group of displaced Batwa on their way home, were arrested and shot by RPF soldiers. The widow of one of the victims stated that she had not dared to report the incident to the new local authorities, as she had no faith that they would listen to her.

The UNPO mission spoke with a Mutwa who related how more than 70 inhabitants of his village, among whom a group of 17 Batwa, were summoned by RPF soldiers to attend a meeting on the market of the village on June 6, 1994. His wife and four of his children (ages ranging from 4 to 27) were forcibly taken and brought to that meeting. All people present were killed. The soldiers responsible for the massacre fled the region, and an explanation was never given.

Again in another commune in Gitarama prefecture, it was reported that, by the end of June, RPF soldiers killed a group of displaced Batwa who had gone back to their houses to look for food. A Mutwa said this murder had been committed out of pure malignity. On July 18, RPF soldiers summoned a meeting in the village. More than 500 people, among whom several Batwa, attended the meeting and were massacred, according to another inhabitant from the same sector.

Also in Butare prefecture, RPF soldiers made many victims among the Bahutu and Batwa population in the period that the RPF had just taken over the region. Soldiers broke into houses, looking for *Interahamwe*, killing people. However, by that time all those who had participated in the genocide and the massacres had already fled to Zaire, all those who had stayed behind were innocent, according to a Mutwa respondent. His wife and two of his sons, and 8 grand children perished in the RPF violence.

On the other hand, a number of Batwa also participated in the killings. However, on the basis of the investigation, it seems that only in exceptional cases Batwa willingly sided with the *Interahamwe*. More often, Batwa were forced to kill Batutsi, under the threat to be killed themselves if they did not co-operate. One such exceptional case is that of Masango commune (Gitarama prefecture), where the UNPO mission spoke with a number of Batwa respondents who said that many Batwa from that commune were member of the *Interahamwe* and had participated in the genocide. Some Batwa had joined the *Interahamwe* long before April 1994. Money and economic security formed the main reasons for joining the *Interahamwe*. The former mayor of Masango, Mr. Mpamo, was the chief of the local *Interahamwe*. Mpamo influenced the Batwa from this region to join the *Interahamwe* and prepared them for the genocide. This process of brainwashing had already started in 1990. Mpamo succeeded in binding the Batwa and to make them dependent of his support by offering them food, work and political protection. Mpamo was a hero for the Batwa, according to our respondent. The Batwa formed an vulnerable group, both socially and economically, were easily manipulated<sup>20</sup>.

Batwa were not so much politically motivated to join the *Interahamwe*, as many Batwa did not realize fully what it was all about. Mpamo was founding member of the MNRD, and a very influential figure in Masango. The Batwa were poor and in need of support. The same goes for the poor Bahutu in the area. Generally, the involvement with the *Interahamwe* was considered as work, paid work, and that was something to cherish. The first Batwa to join the *Interahamwe* were dancers and singers. A dance group was formed that performed throughout the country. In that sense the *Interahamwe* was more than a political movement, the social and cultural aspects were purposely stressed. In fact, the political message was not the main attraction for Batwa who joined the *Interahamwe*, the prospect to perform in a national group and to receive a salary were. The respondents did not know of any kind of division of tasks within the *Interahamwe* among Bahutu and Batutsi, but were not surprised that Batwa often looted after the Bahutu had killed the inhabitants of a house, for the Batwa had joined the *Interahamwe* for economic reasons mainly.

The account of a Mutwa inhabitant of Gikoma sector (Ntongwe commune, Gitarama prefecture) formed an interesting supplement to the Masango case. He stressed that no Batwa were involved in the genocide and the massacres, just because they were not corruptible by economic incentives, as the Batwa in this sector were relatively successful in improving their living conditions on their own, with the assistance of APB.

In the African Rights report, *Rwanda : death, despair and defiance*, some cases of participation of Batwa in the genocide and the massacres are described. The story of a Mututsi woman from Tambwe commune (Gitarama prefecture) is described. The woman was gang raped by a group of *Interahamwe*, who « gave » her to a Mutwa siding with them, « intended as a humiliation in the social context of Rwanda. »<sup>21</sup>. This practise of handing on women to men from groups that are looked down upon, such as the Batwa, or men who were unwashed and dressed in rags, was confirmed by accounts given by other victims. In the report is described how Batwa were used by the *Interahamwe* to scandalize women. The *Interahamwe* gave Batutsi women to Batwa men to be raped in the streets, especially near road blocks, as is related by two women from Ntongwe commune (Gitarama prefecture). A woman from Greater Kigali relates how she was discovered in her hiding place by a group of *Interahamwe* among whom were several Batwa. She describes the Batwa as the most aggressive members of the group, pressing the others to gang rape her in public. One member of the group refused ; the Batwa *Interahamwe* later allegedly filed a complaint against him, denouncing his soft hearted (-) behaviour<sup>22</sup>.

Another case of Batwa siding with the *Interahamwe* took place in Shyorongi commune (Kigali prefecture). The UNPO mission met Jean Paul Biramvu, of the Rwandan human rights organization CLADHO<sup>23</sup>, who explained that even before April 1994, the Batwa of Shyorongi commune were involved in activities targeting the Batutsi population. Biramvu acknowledged that the Batwa, due to poverty and the low esteem in which they are held, formed a vulnerable group in Rwandan society that was easy to manipulate. According to Biramvu, some Batwa collaborated with the *Interahamwe* for reasons of material benefit ; after the *Interahamwe* had massacred their victims, Batwa were given the opportunity to loot the houses.

This view was confirmed by Mr. Alphonse Marie Nkubito, the Rwandan Minister of Justice, who compared the role of the Batwa in the massacres of 1994, with their alleged contribution

to the ethnic unrest of 1959. Mr. Jean Paul Godding (Caritas International) explained that Batwa, due to their extremely vulnerable position in Rwandan society, often sided with the winning side, as to survive in the turmoil of the political developments.

Biramvu mentioned that he had heard of Batwa being killed in revenge for alleged participation in the killings. In the prison of Kigali, the UNPO mission met with several Batwa from Shyorongi commune. Among them were two women, from Kanyinya sector, who had been arrested with in the first week of September, upon their return from Goma, Zaire. They had left for Zaire in the beginning of July, fleeing the war, but facing the incredible circumstances in the refugee camps they had decided to return. The women told that all the Batwa from Shyorongi who were not killed or had fled, had been arrested and were in jail now. They claimed to be innocent, but stated that they were accused of participating in the genocide.

Other Batwa prisoners in Kigali, Butare and Gitarama with whom the UNPO mission spoke, acknowledged to have committed crimes. However, many stressed that they had been forced to kill:

## **H: Current after-war situation in Rwanda**

The entire population of Rwanda suffered tremendously, particularly in the period of genocidal terror following the assassination of president Habyarimana. The devastation, destruction and fear in Rwanda today is apparent everywhere. It is estimated that about one million people were killed, mainly Batutsi. Bahutu and Batwa were massacred by tens of thousands. About two million people, mainly Bahutu, but also considerable groups of Batutsi and Batwa, fled the country to seek refuge in the neighbouring countries. A large section of the surviving population is still in refugee or displaced persons camps within the country, which slows down the restoration of the economic, social and political life of the country. As a result of the genocide, massacres and war, the composition of the population changed drastically. The Batutsi, formerly about 15% of the total population, were decimated. The same holds true for the Batwa (formerly about 0.4% of the total population).

A growing section of the population is formed by the so-called *1959 returnees*. Rwandan refugees who fled the country between 1959 and 1973, or who were born in exile, and return to Rwanda. According to Alessandra Morelli (UNHCR-Gisenyi), more than 500.000 Batutsi already returned from Zaire only, since July 1994. One and a half million more *returnees* are expected. She feared that these people could create immense problems, as they expect to return to their promised land, and are not prepared to face the chaos in the country. Often, these people have, to a certain extent, lost touch with their motherland, in some cases they do not speak Kinyarwanda. Coming from Uganda, as many of them do, they are English speaking, while French was the colonial second language of Rwanda. The entire population of Rwanda went through a period of major traumatization. The effects of this will show for years to come. Fear, distrust, hatred and feelings of revenge are felt deeply among the population. Large sections of the Rwandan population are particularly vulnerable, such as widows, widowers, orphans, unaccompanied children, and the handicapped. These groups require special attention and support.

Apart from the human tragedy, the war caused enormous damage to the infrastructure of the country. Houses, buildings offices, roads, bridges, were demolished. Crops and farm land were severely damaged. In short, the economy is ruined. The new government experienced and will experience major difficulties to administer the country. The administration is severely handicapped, as so many people were killed or fled the country. The police, judiciary and also the educational system lack staff, funds and equipment to effectively carry out their duties.

At the same time, notable efforts to restore normal life in the country are underway by the Rwandan government, with assistance of international and local organizations and NGOs. However, the great emphasis on the military and the lack of resources of the central government and local and regional authorities leads to serious problems for the restoration of a functioning civilian authority and results in continuing human rights violations by army personnel in some parts of the country.

The openness of the Rwandan government in admitting its problems, weakness and mistakes is very positive. It is praiseworthy that international human rights monitors have the opportunity to work throughout the country. The government's declared intent to respect human rights and to develop a non-ethnic based government and society should be taken seriously.

### **I: After-war situation ; Batwa perspective**

Like all the Rwandans, the Batwa suffered during the past months and continue to suffer from the consequences of the war. As Batwa were especially vulnerable and generally extremely poor, the war was a particularly severe blow for them. Batwa did not have anything to fall back on ; no financial reserves, no property, in many cases no social network. Poverty, hunger and health problems are rampant today.

From the research done by the UNPO mission, it appears that the already small number of Batwa in Rwanda was reduced drastically as a result of the genocide and the war. Many Batwa said they feared for the extinction of the Batwa community in Rwanda. Rough estimations indicate that maybe about one third of the Batwa population, i.e. about 10.000 people, died during the past period of genocide, massacres and war. This rough estimation is based upon the provisional census carried out by the UNPO mission ; extrapolations seems to justify the given figures. Another 8.000 to 10.000 Batwa fled the country. This brings the total of Batwa who remain in the country as of today at 10.000 to 12.000. This figure is confirmed by Mr.Fidèle Kaboyi Munyakazi of the Zairese Batwa organization Pygasse<sup>24</sup>, who estimated that about 45% of the Rwandan Batwa were either killed or fled.

Many Batwa in different parts of the country expressed a deep sense of insecurity. The civilian authorities had not yet established a firm grip on the country, and the military was responsible for maintaining law and order. Many Batwa told of daily incidents during which people were beaten up, arrested, jailed or even killed. Often these arrests took place at the initiative of severely traumatized Batutsi and had an entirely arbitrary character. Incidents of

this kind were reported by Batwa in several communes in Gitarama, Butare and Kigali prefectures.

In Ntongwe commune, it was reported that 250 out of 578 Batwa were killed by RPF soldiers, between July 27 and the beginning of August 1994. Bahutu and Batwa had villagers responded to a call by the RPF to return to their houses. Upon arrival in their sectors, they were killed. Nobody dared to file a complaint or to demand an investigation as yet, for fear of possible repercussions.

A group Batwa from Nyamabuye commune (Gitarama prefecture), reportedly fled their houses in mid November 1994, as they felt threatened by RPF soldiers in the region. The Bahutu and Batwa in the commune faced accusations of participation in the genocide and of stealing and slaughtering cattle of fellow Batutsi villagers. At least ten Batwa were reported to have been killed by RPF soldiers, since the end of the war<sup>25</sup>. The Batwa stressed that they had never been involved in any killings, but it remained unclear to what extent they had taken advantage of the death of their fellow villagers for stealing their cattle. However, a minor crime such as stealing cattle can never justify arbitrary killings such as seemed to have taken place in Nyamabuye commune.

Some Batwa ended up in prison. The UNPO mission visited the prisons of Butare (22 Batwa out of around 2000 prisoners), Gitarama (16 out of around 1000) and Kigali (34 out of 4623 at the end of October 1994). In Kigali prison, the Batwa men indicated that they were in a disadvantaged position, compared with the other prisoners. This was confirmed by our Muhutu prisoner-guide. Batwa allegedly did often not receive their due share of the scarce food and commodities provided, such as soap and blankets, as they were pushed aside by fellow prisoners when lining up for distribution. The Batwa prisoners expressed the wish to be grouped together in the prison, as to be able to counter this kind of discrimination more effectively. The UNPO mission forwarded this request to the prison director. In Butare and Gitarama, the Batwa were, at least in this respect, better off.

A certain degree of lawlessness is found throughout the country. This should be no surprise, as the civilian authorities were in many cases only installed in November 1994, and many of them are entirely new to the job and sometimes even to the country. The new administration suffers from a general lack of manpower and insufficient resources. There is a tendency among the population to grab whatever is available. As so many people were killed or fled, many houses and plots of land were abandoned. Many survivors need new houses and take or are allocated what was left abandoned. In this un-co-ordinated and often greedy process, the Batwa are not very successful in claiming or procuring what they need. In the chaos Batwa sometimes even lost their access to clay swamps needed for pottery.

Among the numerous orphans in Rwanda are many Batwa children. It was impossible to determine how many exactly. However, the UNPO mission received several indications that the reception of Batwa orphans in foster families was problematic. People seemed less prepared to take in Batwa children than other orphans.

Another sign that the traditional discrimination against Batwa has not disappeared with the installation of the new government, is that Batwa experienced difficulties in finding

employment. Although there was more than enough work to be done, especially in construction work, Batwa in Nyabusindi commune (Butare prefecture) complained that they had a hard time in being hired, since employers, as always, preferred to take Batutsi. Among the newly installed civilian authorities were hardly any Batwa, nor were there many Batwa among the RPF troops.

However, with respect to the traditional discrimination of the Batwa, some Batwa with whom the UNPO mission spoke, reported positive changes. It was remarked that the atmosphere of ethnic and social segregation has lessened. This might, to a certain extent, be due to the fact that the Bahutu with the strongest anti-Batwa antipathies fled the country. « As the Bahutu are not in charge anymore », the Batwa of Masango commune experienced less difficulties to procure the clay they needed. The new government's policies, strongly in favor of national unity and discouraging ethnic strife, is another important factor contributing to this changing social climate. The experiences of the Rwandan refugees in exile in Uganda, where traditional distinctions lost their sharp edges, changed the attitudes of the *1959 returnees*.

Despite everything, the majority of the Batwa interviewed by the UNPO mission expressed their hope and careful trust that this new government would bring lasting peace and structural improvement of their situation. In Runda commune (Gitarama prefecture), this optimism was expressed most vividly ; the UNPO mission was thanked for its visit with a performance of traditional songs praising the RPF.

## **J: Situation in the refugee camps outside Rwanda**

At different stages during the war, a total of approximately two million Rwandans fled their country to seek refuge in the neighbouring countries. These refugees were mainly Bahutu. The largest groups ended up in Zaire (North and South Kivu), Tanzania and, to a lesser extent, in Burundi. The sombre fate of the refugees in Zaire and Tanzania is sufficiently known. In the first weeks after the massive arrival of the refugees, the international media covered the epidemics, hunger and insecurity in the camps. Since then, international attention subdued. The emergency phase is over, but many problems remain to be solved.

Although the Rwandan government called several times for a swift return of the refugees to Rwanda, many refugees do not consider repatriation yet. This is a complex matter. Among the refugees are innumerable who are responsible for planning, implementing and carrying out the genocide. Former government representatives, officials, and thousands of ordinary civilians who have blood on their hands. These people face prosecution and severe punishment once they return to Rwanda. Therefore they intend to stay in the camps, until they have gathered enough strength to return by force, overthrow the government and abolish what has been achieved by it. Their evil plans would need massive support. To that end, the refugees engage in a large scale operations of brainwashing and indoctrination. A well organized propaganda machine spreads fear for the RPF among the refugees, convincing them to stay abroad. Refugees are also prevented from returning by physical force. Refugees who speak openly of returning are threatened and sometimes killed. This is confirmed by aid workers of international organizations, who foresee a situation of structural, long term exile, which poses

entirely different problems to the international aid efforts. Besides food, clean water, medicines and shelter, the refugees are in need of education, training and employment.

Already in an early stage, international aid and human rights organizations warned for a « Cambodia situation » : they foresaw that the distribution of aid in the refugee camps would enable those responsible for the genocide to strike back when they have recovered their strength. The continued threat posed by the re-groupment of former government forces and militia in those camps, and the intimidation by them of fellow Rwandans keeps Rwanda in a state of military alert which harms efforts to re-build the country and to reduce the role of the military.

### **K: Refugee camps ; Batwa perspective**

The Batwa form a particularly vulnerable group, due to their size and their disadvantaged socio-economic and political position before the war. This is evident even in the refugee camps, where Batwa are experiencing more difficulty in obtaining basic necessities, including food, plastic sheeting for shelter and medical care. Batwa refugees seem to have disproportionate difficulty in obtaining employment with international aid organizations active in the camps.

To escape the genocidal terror and the war, many Batwa fled to neighbouring countries. The UNPO mission visited refugee camps in Zaire, Burundi and Tanzania, in its quest for the Batwa. Due to security reasons and a general lack of information on the side of aid organizations on the Batwa, the mission experienced difficulties in gathering information. Therefore, it is hard to make definitive statements on the precise number of Batwa in the refugee camps.

In North Kivu, Zaire, a beginning was made with a census of the Batwa among the Rwandan refugees. This census was carried out by two local Zairese Batwa organizations Pygasse and Seipy<sup>26</sup>, in collaboration with UNHCR-Goma. In response to the crisis in Rwanda, Goma-based Pygasse had shifted focus from its structural development work for local Zairese Batwa, to emergency relief for the Batwa refugees from Rwanda. The UNPO mission spoke extensively with Pygasse's Executive Secretary, Fidèle Kaboyi Munyakazi and travelled with him to a number of refugee camps.

On September 22, 1994, Pygasse published a preliminary report with the results of the census carried out thus far. In Katale, Kibumba and Mugunga refugee camps, about 1900 Batwa were registered. More than one third of the Batwa refugees registered by Pygasse had come from Gisenyi prefecture, among whom allegedly some 150 *Impunyu*. Another 25% came from Ruhengeri prefecture. On the basis of this assessment, Munyakazi feared that maybe up to 5.000 Rwandan Batwa got stranded in North Kivu and more were arriving. According to Munyakazi, the majority of the Batwa in North Kivu had fled with their Bahutu countrymen, fleeing the RPF violence<sup>27</sup>. This view was confirmed by the interviews that the UNPO mission took in the camps. Jean Pierre Godding (Caritas International) stressed that the Batwa were not politically involved in the conflict ; they just tried to flee from the war. It surprised

him to hear that in other parts of the country the Batwa had been targeted by the *Interahamwe*<sup>28</sup>.

Many of the Batwa in North Kivu had, in the period after the take-over by the RPF on October 1, 1990, fled their houses, in an effort to escape from the war that followed. Some of them originated even from as far as Byumba prefecture. Munyakazi estimated that about 100 Batwa had crossed the border already before April 1994.

Munyakazi expressed his worries about the circumstances under which the Batwa tried to survive in the camps. The daily administration of the refugee camps was to a large extent, in the hands of former Bahutu administrators, who represent the traditional power structure of Rwanda, with all its defaults. As the aid organizations cooperate with these former leaders, the refugee camps did not exactly form a climate for positive change. Batwa were discriminated against, as they were in Rwanda before April 1994. A group of about 80-100 Batwa who were staying in Katala refugee camp, had by the time of the visit of the UNPO mission moved on to the north, where they had found refuge in Kaswa, a Zairese Batwa village. There, the UNPO mission spoke with Batwa from Runda commune (Gitarama prefecture). They had moved from Katala to Kaswa, as circumstances for Batwa were very poor in the camp. Still, these Batwa seemed to be on the same political line as the Bahutu extremists in the North Kivu camps. They blamed the RPF for killing their president and stated that « it was only after April 6, 1994, that they had come to realize that it were the Batutsi who had secretly been preparing for the massacres ». This seemed to be a classical example of how people can be entirely brainwashed. This political point of view, however, did not prevent that they had been treated in Katala camp as second rank persons by their fellow refugees.

Mid December 1994, the Zairese army engaged in a military operation forcing the refugees back within the limits of the refugee camps. It is very well possible that these Batwa had to leave Kaswa village and are again living in the refugee camps.

In Muganga refugee camp, the UNPO mission spoke with a delegation of Batwa refugees who had arrived in North Kivu by beginning of August. They fled Giciye commune (Gisenyi prefecture) after the RPF had engaged in large scale killings of all the remaining Bahutu and Batwa villagers. However, despite their anti-RPF attitude, the Batwa explained that their position in the camp was weak. They stated that the Batwa were disproportionately badly provided with food, clothing, cooking utensils, plastic sheeting, educational materials and so forth. With the help of Pygasse they had organized themselves and had elected some leaders from their midst. Jean Damascene Kayombya, founding member of ADBR, was one of them. One of the goals of the Batwa was to secure some jobs with the aid organizations active in the region. The UNPO mission spoke with Mrs. Agnès Mukarugomwa, social services coordinator for Caritas International in Muganga refugee camp, who related how Batwa grouped together in the camps, keeping aside from others and not participating fully in camp life, clearly afraid to manifest themselves.

In Kibumba refugee camp, refugees are clustered together according to their prefecture of origin in Rwanda. An effort was made to cluster the Batwa refugees from all over Rwanda together in a tenth « prefecture », as to ensure that they receive their due share of the distributed aid.

In Gisiza, near Jomba, about 60 kilometres north of Goma, the UNPO mission met with another group of Batwa. These Batwa came from Kinigi commune (Ruhengeri prefecture). They had set up an provisory administrative structure, including elected leaders. The Batwa in Gisiza stated that they would only return to Rwanda, when their Bahutu countrymen did, as their faith in the new (RPF) government was limited.

In South Kivu, the Bukavu based Batwa organization PIDP<sup>29</sup>, made an effort to help the Rwandan Batwa refugees who arrived in Zaire. On August 11, 1994, PIDP started a census of the Batwa among the refugees from Rwanda. PIDP counted a total of 239 families<sup>30</sup>, with an average of 4 children, and 29 unaccompanied children bringing the total on roughly 950. The last Batwa to be registered by PIDP arrived on September 9, 1994. On the basis of its investigation, PIDP stated that the first Batwa refugees arrived in South Kivu around July 20, 1994. As PIDP did not have the means to visit all the refugee camps in Bukavu region, or to continue its investigation after September 9, it was estimated that a number of 3.000 Batwa would be more accurate. PIDP reported that there were no *Impunyu* among the Batwa refugees, only potters. The majority, about 114 families, had come from Kibuye prefecture, in the former French Turquoise Zone. Unfortunately, the PIDP operated in isolation of the international aid organizations active in the region. The co-operation with UN agencies in Bukavu was far from ideal. Representatives of UNHCR-Bukavu feared that PIDP was not entirely altruistic in its desire to help the Batwa refugees from Rwanda.

Since UNHCR transferred the last refugees remaining in transit camps in Bukavu town, to the permanent refugee camps in the neighbourhood, PIDP lost track of them. UNHCR officials acknowledged that they were not able to identify the Batwa among the refugees. PIDP spokesman Mutimanwa expressed his hope that future co-operation would prove possible with UNHCR and international NGOs, such as Médecins sans Frontières and Caritas International.

On the basis on the census carried out by both PIDP and Pygasse, the UNPO mission estimated the number of Batwa refugees in Zaire at 5.000-8.000 people. That is a considerable number, given the fact that there were some 25.000-30.000 Batwa all together in Rwanda before April 1994.

For the number of Batwa refugees in Burundi, no precise calculations can be made, as there is just no information available. The UNPO mission spoke extensively with Gisèle Allaard, social services co-ordinator for Oxfam Quebec in Burundi, and some of her staff workers, recruited among the refugees. Through their kind assistance UNPO had the opportunity to meet with the Batwa population of Magara refugee camp in Ngozi province. In that specific camp there were some 64 Batwa families, in total some 358 persons, including children, living dispersed over the camp. The Batwa in Magara had mainly come from Butare and Gikongoro prefectures. New refugees, among whom Batwa, were arriving daily, and as yet nobody had expressed the wish to return to Rwanda. A large group of Batwa from Nyaruhengeri (Butare prefecture) arrived in July 1994. The majority of the Batwa refugees in Magara camp were potters. Oxfam Quebec had assisted the Batwa refugees in taking up pottery, while staying in the camp, as there was ample clay (be it of inferior quality) to be found in the camp. The average produce of one potter was about forty pots a week. Pots (water vessels and cooking pots) and little ovens were sold on the camp market. Other articles, such as vases and

ashtrays, were sold outside the camp, mainly to aid workers. The potters, however, lacked wood to be able to bake their pots properly. UNHCR was distributing wood, but only for cooking. The Batwa refugees referred to specific health problems, such as rheumatism, possibly related to their occupation. The lack of soap was strongly felt, as potters tend to become rather dirty from working with clay. For the Batwa, pottery was vital in order to survive in exile, as they had no other resources whatsoever to fall back on. The Batwa, again with assistance of Oxfam, had founded a music and dance group.

With respect to the number of Batwa in other refugee camps in Burundi no exact figures were available. However, a figure of at least 1.000 Batwa refugees in Burundi seemed to be justified. Unfortunately, the Burundese Batwa organization APGD<sup>31</sup>, was not involved in support work for the Rwandan Batwa refugees. Therefore, UNPO lacked a well informed guide.

In Tanzania, the security situation prevented the UNPO mission from touching upon the subject of the Batwa presence in the refugee camps. In the first place, according to UNHCR Social Services Co-ordinator Myriam Houtart, there were no Batwa whatsoever in Benaco. Benaco is the largest Rwandan refugee camp in Tanzania, with around 240.000 refugees. Secondly, UNHCR stressed that it would not be wise to dig into the matter too much, with the result that the UNPO mission obtained hardly any information. However, the mission met briefly with a refugee staff worker of DRA, who informed the mission of the presence of a group of at least 1,000 Batwa in Benaco camp.

That the Batwa have a difficult position in the camps in Tanzania is beyond doubt. The Batutsi in the camp make an extreme effort not to inform others of the fact that they are Batutsi, as that would hamper their security. The same holds true for the Batwa refugees. A nurse of the International Rescue Committee (IRC) related how two Batwa men were transferred from Benaco to Burigi refugee camp, where they were not welcome either. She was very much surprised to witness this incident, as the rejection of these newcomers in the camp was most vehement. The two Batwa would have risked their lives, had they stayed on. They were transferred to the so-called «mixed marriages» camp, where mixed Bahutu-Batutsi couples were staying.

## **L: Situation in the displaced persons camps in Rwanda**

Concerning the situation in the displaced persons camps inside Rwanda, the UNPO mission spoke with representatives of several international organizations, such as MSF, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNREO and the Lutheran World Federation (LWF). For the displaced persons camps in Gikongoro prefecture, both Ms. Marie Pierre Gomez (UNICEF) and Mr. Alessandro Bolzoni (UNHCR) stressed that the emergency phase in the five main displaced persons camps, Kaduha, Kibeho, Rukondo, Ndago and Cyanika, was not quite over yet. The displaced persons in the camps were confronted with numerous problems. Hunger, malnutrition were still rampant in the camps, despite the international aid operation. Also with respect to the health situation, much needed to be done. As of the large scale and the overpopulation of the camps it had proven to be difficult to secure adequate assistance. The operation was hindered by several factors, such as the influential position of former

government representatives within the camps. It was said that the administration and the distribution of relief was monopolized by Bahutu extremist elements. The security and human rights situation in the camps was not sufficiently controlled, despite efforts of both the Rwandan government and the international community. Continuing *Interahamwe* activities against displaced persons were reported, as well as incidental attacks by RPF soldiers on elements held responsible for the genocide and the massacres. The government announced evacuation of the camps worried many, as it was judged to be a premature manoeuvre. Many displaced persons were not prepared to return to their houses yet, as they had no faith in the new government. Reports of instability of the new government, lack of reliable positive information on the actual situation in the country, combined with an active anti-RPF propaganda campaign led by former government supporters in the camps, created great fear among the displaced.

### **M. Displaced persons camps ; Batwa perspective**

In the summer of 1994, displaced persons camps were set up in Kibuye prefecture, in the *Zone Turquoise*. Batwa of Mabanza commune informed the UNPO mission on the situation in the camps in that area. The Batwa had fled their villages in July 1994, to escape the *Interahamwe* terror, and stayed in the camps until these were dissolved by the RPF in October. Until mid-August, the overall management of the camps was in the hands of the French troops stationed in the area. The Batwa of Mabanza commune complained about the harsh French regime in the camps. Upon the departure of the French, Senegalese UNAMIR troops took over. UNAMIR was in charge of delivering food to the camps, but the aid was only brought into the camps, while the distribution of the goods within the camps was left to the displaced. The Batwa claimed that they were discriminated against and that they did not receive their due share of food and other relief aid commodities. The Batwa explained that there had been no way to protest against this treatment, as they formed a minority and the Bahutu threatened to use violence.

Bolzoni advised the UNPO mission to visit Médecins sans Frontières (MSF), as to get detailed information on the composition of the population of the displaced persons camps Gikongoro prefecture. Unfortunately, the MSF staff did not have a clue whether there were any Batwa to be found in the camps in Gikongoro prefecture. However, in Rukondo camp, the UNPO mission met with representatives of a group of approximately 100 Batwa from Kanazi sector (Kanzenze commune, Kigali prefecture), who had fled their village on April 15, 1994, escaping the *Interahamwe* massacres. They told the UNPO mission that virtually the entire sector population, including 46 Batwa families, i.e. some 275 persons, had fled. Hundred Batwa ended up in Rukondo ; the others either died during their flight or found refuge in other safe heavens. The Batwa in Rukondo estimated that there were about 1500 Batwa all together in Rukondo camp, all potters. The Batwa said that they experience major difficulties in the camp, as they feel discriminated against by their fellow refugees. They regretted that they did not have a section for themselves as together they would feel stronger and more able to cope with the discrimination. No Batwa had any jobs with the international aid organizations active in the camps, since, as they said, they did not have any influential contacts. « The Batwa, as a minority, are not represented », is how they put it. The Batwa tried to secure additional

income from selling pots. However, the displaced were not in the position to afford pots, and the market of Gikongoro was too far off. Moreover, for clay, the Batwa had to travel far and pay \$10 for 30 kilos.

Despite the dire circumstances in Rukondo camp, the Batwa were not ready to return to their village. They recalled how miserable life (poverty, famine, discrimination) had been before April 1994, and were convinced to find the situation even worse than it had been. Moreover, they said to be afraid of RPF retaliation activities, as they heard that Batwa were accused of having participated in the *Interahamwe* massacres. On the other hand, they mentioned that they had hardly any accurate information on the situation at home. Only most rarely they had the opportunity to listen to a radio since they arrived in the camp. The few relatives who had gone home to check out the situation, came back with reports stressing the insecurity and instability in the region.

In Cyanika displaced persons camp, also in Gikongoro prefecture, the UNPO mission met with two groups of Batwa. The displaced in Cyanika camp were clustered together according to their communes of origin. In every section Batwa could be found. A group of about 150 Batwa from Nyanza and Rusatira communes (Butare prefecture) commented upon their situation in the camp. The several Batwa groups hardly maintained contact. The main reason for this lack of cohesion within the Batwa community was the physical weakness of the Batwa. They lacked the strength to visit each other, let alone to gather for singing and dancing. The Batwa also stressed that they did not dare to return to their houses yet, as they had received information on the continuing massacres in their home area. Broadcasts of Radio Rwanda claiming that the situation had calmed down, were distrusted. The Batwa tried to secure a living in the camps by producing and selling pots. However, they experienced the same difficulties as their fellow Batwa in Rukondo.

### **N: The international community and the Batwa question**

The last word has not been said yet on the role of the international community in Rwanda. The discussion of the political complicity of organizations specializing in humanitarian relief was only taken up recently. This is not the place for a UNPO contribution to that discussion.

The UNPO mission spoke with a considerable number of representatives of international organizations and UN agencies, active in Rwanda as well as in the refugee camps, sounding them out on their knowledge of and possible policies or activities with respect to the Batwa. The result of this part of the investigation of the UNPO mission was disappointing. Only some organizations were at all aware of the existence of the Batwa. Most organizations seemed to think that the Rwandan population was composed of two groups, Bahutu and Batutsi, only. Although the Batwa form a tiny minority there is no understandable reason to oversimplify the complexities of the Rwandan society.

Even fewer organizations had taken the specific problems of the Batwa into account in their policies. The exception to this rule are Caritas International, active in North Kivu, Zaire, and Oxfam Quebec, active in Ngozi province, Burundi.

For Caritas, the UNPO mission spoke extensively with Jean Pierre Godding and Agnès Mukarugomwa, respectively general co-ordinator and social services co-ordinator for Mugunga refugee camp. Caritas' policy with respect to the Batwa among the refugees, can be summarized as follows : the Batwa were targeted as one of several vulnerable groups among the refugee population, together with unaccompanied children, widows, teenage, mothers, etc.. Caritas focused on integration of these vulnerable groups in camp life, in the conviction that integration would in the long run be more profitable than separating them from the other refugees. Mukarugomwa explained that, with respect to the Batwa refugees, a five step program was about to be initiated. First step : to locate the Batwa in and outside the refugee camps in Goma region ; secondly : to stimulate the Batwa to make use of the (medical, educational, social etc.) services offered in the camps ; thirdly : to promote the integration of the Batwa in the refugee society ; fourthly : to have a Mutwa join the Caritas staff ; and fifthly : to initiate, if necessary, an aid program dovetailed to specific Batwa needs. Mukarugomwa expressed her disbelief in the advantages of clustering Batwa refugees in a separate physical and/or administrative unit within the refugee camps, such as was the case with the Batwa of Kibumba. She was afraid that this would foster a sense of difference, which should at all costs be avoided.

The Caritas International branch active in Bukavu, did not have special provisions in its program to assist Batwa refugees. The interim general co-ordinator of Caritas Bukavu emphasized that singling out the Batwa would jeopardize Caritas' reconciliation work among Bahutu and Batutsi refugees in South Kivu.

Ms. Pauline Ward, of the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC), responsible for community health work in Kibumba and Kahindo refugee camps, told the UNPO mission that, to her knowledge, by mid-September 1994, there were at least 96 Batwa in Kibumba. Although it was acknowledged that this group needed special care due to its vulnerable position, no steps were or would be taken to meet these needs.

Senior nurse Mr. Germain Lubango, working for MSF-Holland, told the UNPO mission that in April 1994, a group of about 30 Batwa families had arrived in North Kivu, settling in Gisiza. MSF was at that time involved in a assessment of the needs of the Zairese population of that area. It was acknowledged that the Rwandan Batwa formed a group that needed special protection, but no steps were taken in that direction. By the time of the major influx of Rwandan refugees in July 1994, MSF handed over the responsibility for the food distribution to the refugees in that area to the American Refugee Committee (ARC).

A representative of UNICEF Bukavu explained that the regional approach policy for the Pygmy populations of Congo and Zaire, victimized as a result of the ethnic unrest in the area in the past years, had been postponed at the outbreak of the Rwandan crisis. UNICEF focused in its relief strategies solely on unaccompanied children in the South Kivu refugee camps. Despite the knowledge of and experience with the vulnerable position of minority groups in war and refugee situations, UNICEF had not developed any policies with respect to the Rwandan Batwa refugees. On a personal title, a UNICEF representative said that he realized that Batwa did not integrate easily. Due to the discrimination they had always been confronted with, Batwa had developed a deeply rooted fear for others. Moreover, he thought

the communication level of the Batwa to be extremely poor, which would, to his views, interfere with the integrated approach cherished by the international community.

In the UNHCR emergency relief operations manual, an entire chapter is dedicated to vulnerable groups, minorities and isolated refugees, with an interesting set of guidelines with respect to assessment, screening, assistance etc. « Every society has its social, religious, political or ethnic minorities whose access to services, even under normal conditions, is limited. These groups of persons become particularly vulnerable in a refugee emergency, as assistance is likely to be channelled through the leaders of the majority groups », it reads. However, despite this recognition, the UNHCR offices in Burundi, Tanzania and Rwanda itself, had not developed specific policies with respect to the Batwa. On the other hand, UNHCR Goma, did pay attention to the Batwa, stimulated by the Zairese Batwa organizations Pygasse and Seipy. UNHCR financially and technically supported the first phase of the census carried out by Pygasse and Seipy among the Batwa refugees. In Bukavu, the co-operation between UNHCR and PIDP had, for different reasons, failed. Representatives of UNHCR, with their colleagues of UNICEF, Caritas and other organizations, described PIDP as over demanding and not co-operative.

In Burundi, the UNPO mission spoke with Ms Gisèle Allaard, working for Oxfam Quebec in Magara refugee camp. The main aims of the Oxfam policies with respect to the Batwa refugees were working towards integration of the Batwa in the refugee community. Batwa were considered as one among several vulnerable groups, together with the Batutsi refugees, orphans, non-accompanied children, handicapped etc.. Batwa were stimulated to make use of the camp's services and provisions, such as the clinics, market and the workshops set up by Oxfam. However, Batwa did not frequent the Oxfam workshops, not even the pottery workshop, as they preferred to live and work among themselves, not feeling at ease with others. As a result of this reclusive attitude, Oxfam acknowledged the need of paying extra attention to the Batwa refugees. Batwa potters were assisted in producing little ovens, to be sold in the camp. In co-operation with a Rwandan organization active in the field of education, Oxfam was in the process of developing an educational program dovetailed to the needs of Batwa children.

In Rwanda, the general picture is the same : very few organizations are informed of the presence, background or the needs of the Batwa. Moreover the UNPO did not find or hear of an international or local organization active in Rwanda paying specific attention to the problems and needs of the Batwa.

## **O. Overall needs of the Rwandan population**

The main needs of the Rwandan population can be summarized as follows : In the first place, there is the need to repatriate the Rwandan refugees who sought refuge in the camps in the neighbouring countries and in the displaced persons camps in Rwanda. Of immediate importance is the rapid integration of the refugees and displaced persons in after-war Rwanda. The refugees and displaced persons currently live in depressing circumstances. Even as the immediate emergency phase is over, due to efforts of the international community, in exile no

structural solutions in terms of livelihood, security and development can be realized. The presence of the refugees outside the country is a heavy burden both for the receiving countries, as well as for the Rwandan government, since among the refugees are large concentrations of extremist Bahutu, some guilty of innumerable crimes, who prepare a military comeback to Rwanda.

Secondly, there is the need to rebuild the country and to rehabilitate the population. In order to do this, the establishment of an effective civil authority, capable of maintaining law and order, providing a proper and fair judicial system, establishing democracy, and guaranteeing the respect for human rights, is vital.

On the one hand, reconciliation needs to be promoted. To overcome recent traumas and historical contradictions serious efforts, both by the Rwandan government as well as by the international community, are required. The government's philosophy with respect to the creation of a non-ethnic nation, should be promoted and put in practice. On the other hand, justice should be done. The Rwandan tribunal, in whatever form it will take place, will play a major role in bringing this about. For the population to regain trust in mankind and in justice, it is most important that those guilty of planning, directing and committing the genocide on the Batutsi and the massacres of Bahutu and Batwa, are punished.

The basic needs, such as lasting peace, food, shelter, health care, education, employment etc., need to be dealt with without delay, as to enable the population to survive. For the short term, priority should be given to relief and emergency aid. A longer term planning will need to deal with structural development strategies. The Rwandan government has taken up the enormous task to rebuild the country. The international community should give this process a positive push, and support the government where possible in its efforts. Given the legacy of an authoritarian regime, genocide, war, combined with the continuing threats of Bahutu extremists and the inflammable situation in Rwanda itself, the tasks ahead are tremendous. When the support needed, in material as well as moral sense, comes too late, or is insufficient or inadequate, the still volatile situation in Rwanda might easily deteriorate. The international community should take its responsibility and co-operate with the Rwandan government to prevent the worst from happening.

Within this complex of immediate tasks and longer term goals the specific needs of vulnerable and disadvantaged groups within Rwandan society should be acknowledged. The entire Rwandan population was struck by the recent drama. However, some sections of Rwandan society are less capable to cope with the distress than others. The Batwa form one such group.

### **P: Specific needs of the Batwa**

The needs of the Batwa do in many respects not differ from the needs of the rest of the Rwandan population. However, as the Batwa are in a specifically difficult position, like several other vulnerable groups, they do need special attention to meet their needs.

Food is scarce in Rwanda nowadays. Few Batwa own land, and even fewer can live off the produce of their gardens. They can not produce enough to sell their crops on the market. As a result, Batwa are in a more difficult position than many other Rwandans, who at least can rely

on the food they grow themselves. The UNPO mission met with Batwa who described that, in the context of an aid program, hoes were sold. However, the Batwa, like the other poorer sections of Rwandan society, could not afford to buy these tools. This is a factor which should be taken into account by the Rwandan government and by international aid organizations that engage in distribution of food, seeds and tools.

The majority of the Batwa are potters. As a result of the war, the economy collapsed and the market for pots has not yet recovered. Taken into account that the market for earthenware pots was already on the decline long before the April 1994 events, the Batwa have difficulties in securing an income. The UNPO mission spoke with many Batwa who related that their stock of pots was destroyed during the war. This was a major set-back for people who did not own anything else of value. Related problems are the often limited access to high quality clay and the scarcity of firewood. Employment is a basic asset in times that the economy is in shambles. Few Batwa at all in Rwanda have paid jobs. With pottery only few earn what they need. Competition on the economic market is fierce. In Kigali, for example, commercial life has practically been taken over by « 59 *returnees*, leaving little space for the commercially inexperienced Batwa to develop other activities. Batwa who were interviewed by the UNPO mission referred to the fact that they lacked proper clothing to appear in public, when they spoke about their difficulties in securing jobs.

The lack of adequate shelter needs to be addressed. Before April 1994, generally speaking, the Batwa were living in huts and houses of inferior quality. Their houses and possessions were burnt or otherwise destroyed. As a result, a large majority Batwa lack decent shelter. With the lack of blankets and/or decent clothing, this situation is contributing to a generally bad health situation of the Batwa.

Batwa never had sufficient access to educational services. The isolated position of the Batwa in Rwandan society combined with their poverty prevented their participation in schools, be it primary, secondary, higher, vocational, or adult education. The same holds truth for access to health care. Batwa often can not afford these services, are not informed of the possibilities, or do not dare to claim their rights. Today, in the after-war situation, this disadvantage is felt more acutely.

A good relationship with the new authorities, especially on the lower administrative levels is of vital importance for the improvement of the living conditions of the Batwa. The representation of Batwa in the local administrative structures is marginal. Participation of the Batwa in political and social structures needs to be promoted, as to make the population and the leadership familiar with specific Batwa problems.

As described above, the Batwa refugees outside Rwanda, were often discriminated against by their fellow exiled country men. Food, clean water, employment, health care, information are scarce goods in the refugee and displaced persons camps. The Batwa suffer from their marginalized position in the rat race to secure (access to) the necessary goods and services.

## **Q: Support of the Rwandan Government**

The UNPO mission spoke with a number of representatives of the Rwandan government, including H.E. Seth Sendasonga, Minister of Interior and Communal Development ; H.E. Pierre Celestin Rwigema, Minister of Primary and Secondary Education ; H.E. Patrick Mazimhaka, Minister of Youth and Co-operatives and several of his colleagues ; H.E. Alphonse Marie Nkubito, Minister of Justice ; Mr. Murekezi, Cabinet Director of the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Husbandry ; Mr. Murara, General director of the Ministry of Rehabilitation.

The UNPO mission found that the government of Rwanda is engaged in a sincere and ambitious program to reconstruct and develop the country. One of the key-guidelines of the government is to carry out a policy discouraging ethnic distinctions and favoring national unity. This is a logical and necessary approach in a country where the political manipulation of so-called ethnic and other differences led to such incredible suffering. The government will not tolerate unjust differentiation along ethnic or regional lines. Within this set of principles, the government fully acknowledged the need to provide special support to the vulnerable and disadvantaged sections of Rwandan society. The government agreed that the Batwa community forms one of the more vulnerable groups in Rwanda. The traditional and widespread discrimination against Batwa was denounced as a major injustice. It was acknowledged that the Batwa had been abused and looked down upon by the former elite and the population. The government expressed its sense of duty to dispose of this disgraceful heritage of Rwandan history.

The UNPO mission was most pleased with the positive stance of the government in addressing the specific needs of the Batwa. The government drew parallels between the desired emancipation of the Rwandan women and the development and upliftment of the Batwa. Awareness raising among the Batwa with respect to political and civil rights, access to education, employment and the media, full participation in the social structures of after-war Rwandan society and political representation were mentioned as priority goals of the government policy to assist the Batwa.

The UNPO mission highly appreciated the opportunity to discuss in detail possible projects for the development of the Batwa with government representatives. The government came up with creative and substantial proposals to assist the Batwa in different fields.

### **R: Proposed projects for the upliftment of the Batwa**

There is a general need to help the weaker and most disadvantaged sectors of the Rwandan society. Equality and favorable inter-ethnic relations can only be achieved when equal treatment, equal opportunities and non-discrimination against any particular group are realized. The Batwa are one of the weaker, more disadvantaged groups in Rwandan society, for historical and other reasons. Therefore, projects and programs should be developed to help the upliftment of the Batwa and to assist them to fully participate in the reconstruction of Rwanda and its future society. These initiatives need to be designed and implemented in such a way that they promote rather than discourage unity. Therefore, projects and programs

should, where possible, benefit larger sections of the population, rather than only members of one specific ethnic group. This must be reconciled with the need to give special attention to vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, such as the Batwa.

In interviews with the UNPO mission, Batwa described their problems vividly. However, to envisage solutions proved very difficult for many. Indeed, due to lack of education, information and the fact that the Batwa never had the opportunity to influence the course of their lives, Batwa are not very experienced to speak up for themselves. The UNPO mission realized that it will take directed effort and patience to assess how Batwa themselves see their future. Methods such as protracted research and group interviewing will prove useful.

Clearly, few Batwa have developed views on how to improve their situation. Poor potters dream about better clay, but modern pottery techniques or ovens are unthinkably far off. Active participation in Rwanda's political life is inconceivable for many Batwa, who are already excessively proud when their 10 years old son drops out of school only after the third grade. It is vital, however, to listen to the Batwa ; to give them the opportunity to, within the general framework of the reconstruction of Rwanda, build their own future. Development is necessary to free the Batwa from their misery, but development should be implemented with care.

The bottom-up approach, as propagated by international organizations such as ACIST<sup>32</sup>, seems to be a viable method for assessing the needs of the Batwa community. ACIST supports small-scale local initiatives of grass roots organizations and individual civilians, both in Rwanda (e.g. in Kibungo prefecture) as well as in the refugee camps (e.g. in North Kivu-Zaire).

## **EDUCATION**

As to assess the background of the alarming low literacy rate of the Batwa, research needs to be done. H.E. Celestin Rwigema, Minister of Primary and Secondary Education, stated that he was willing to assign that task to a special functionary within his Ministry. He acknowledged that Batwa children suffer from the negative and discriminatory attitudes of both their fellow students as well of their teachers. Batwa children do often not feel at ease in school as they are looked down upon. This mentality needs mending and H.E. Rwigema felt responsible to take this task up. With respect to this need for positive information on the Batwa, H.E. Rwigema suggested to include issues such as Batwa history and cultural tradition in the general curriculum, as to familiarize the population with the Batwa. Due to poverty, many Batwa can not afford school fees, uniforms, notebooks and other basic school equipment. On the other hand, Batwa parents often do not encourage their children to attend school, let alone to consider adult literacy courses for themselves. H.E. Rwigema, and many Batwa with him, stressed the need to engage upon awareness raising work among the Batwa to positively influence their reclusive attitude.

This is important for primary, secondary, higher, vocational and adult education. Especially in the field of vocational training, special programs should be developed, according to H.E. Rwigema. He suggested that training of Batwa in the fields of agriculture, cattle herding,

carpentry, construction and other technical skills, would prove worthwhile. This also with a view on the need to reconstruct the country and to get the economy back on its feet.

Before April 1994, APB had set up a vocational workshop for Batwa youngsters in Kigali. The PIM project, sewing and carpentry training, was all the more important, as it had an income generating aspect to it. The clothing and furniture produced by the pupils was sold. During the war, the workshop was looted and the project was abandoned. However, it is this kind of initiatives that should be taken up with a view to train Batwa children.

H.E. Rwigema proposed to create a specialized administrative unit within the Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education, in charge of designing and promoting educational training programs specifically for the Batwa. The Minister also proposed to create a special fund to finance such initiatives within the Ministry.

## **POTTERY**

Most of the Batwa in Rwanda are potters. Many Batwa, by force of tradition, see their future, and that of their children, in pottery. This should not a priori be discouraged. However, it is important to develop modern pottery techniques as to guarantee the Batwa potters a substantial income.

Guaranteed access to high quality clay is vital for (Batwa) potters. The Batwa, who often do not own land, depend on access to communal clay groves and swamps. Mr. Murekezi, Cabinet Director of the Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Husbandry, stressed that the traditional customary rights of Batwa with regard to the access to groves and swamps should be respected and strengthened. He proposed that exploitation permissions for a certain fixed period should be issued to landless Batwa potters to guarantee them access to high quality clay. In case of under-exploitation of groves owned by others, Mr. Murekezi stated that Batwa potters should be given the opportunity to have access to that clay as well.

Traditional Batwa pottery should be developed into a profession adapted to the demands of modern-day economy. Therefore a shift should be established in the production of traditional products (such as water vessels and cooking pots) to products with a higher commercial value, such as tourist objects, ovens etc. and/or clay products such as bricks, tiles, and other construction materials. Building material are extremely wanted in nowadays Rwanda, as many buildings were (partly) demolished during the war.

Many Batwa expressed their wish to develop modern pottery techniques for the production of ceramics. The modern small scale pottery industries of Gatagara parish (Gitarama prefecture) and Shyorongi commune (Kigali prefecture) have an inspiring reputation among Batwa potters all over Rwanda. These projects were set up, partly with foreign aid, to support Batwa and other potters in these villages. Some interesting lessons, however, can be learned from the Gatagara experiences. The pottery industry of Gatagara was originally set up for the benefit of the handicapped and the Batwa in the commune. However, when the initiative proved successful, other villagers became interested and the Batwa lost their grip on the project.

UNPO spoke with potters who, upon their own initiative, trained Batwa youngsters in pottery skills. This kind of initiatives deserve government and international support. The combination of educational and income-generating components in one project is very worthwhile.

#### **DIVERSIFICATION OF EMPLOYMENT**

With respect to the limited access of Batwa to employment other than pottery, the government came up with several interesting proposals to promote the diversification of employment opportunities among the Batwa.

The UNPO mission met with H.E. Patrick Mazimhaka, Minister of Youth and Co-operatives, and with Mr. Bossa Rutega, head of the Legislation and Inspection Section of this Ministry, and discussed extensively the possibilities of creating co-operatives adapted to the needs of Batwa. Co-operatives of farmers, potters and others, could form viable ways for Batwa to organize themselves in stronger and more competitive structures.

Mr. Rutega displayed genuine interest to look into the possibilities to promote the creation of such co-operatives. A difficulty in creating co-operatives for Batwa is that they live dispersed over the country. The Batwa communities are often very small, especially since the number of Batwa was decimated since April 1994.

Moreover, Mr. Rutega expressed his willingness to look into ways to create co-operatives on a non-geographical basis, in order to bring Batwa from different communes together in one organization.

Many Batwa interviewed by the UNPO mission expressed their desire to set up small-scale income generating projects, such as poultry farms, animal husbandry, commercial dance groups etc. Mr. Abdu Safari, APB representative in Musasa commune (Kigali prefecture), explained how he had set up a small turkey farm in his village with minimal means, generating additional income for the inhabitants of the village, among them many Batwa. As a result of the events of April 1994, however, nothing remains of this particular project.

This kind of projects do not need more than some initial funding (for the purchase of poultry), are easily manageable and benefit the entire village population.

These projects should not be designed exclusively for Batwa, but should benefit all. However, it might be worthwhile to assign the management of such projects to the Batwa participants of the project, as to ensure that Batwa will not be pushed out of the project. The ever prevalent discriminatory attitudes of the population towards the Batwa justify this fear.

M. Murekezi of the Ministry of Agriculture was enthusiastic about the idea of providing management training to future entrepreneurs and co-operative leaders. Batwa should, according to M. Murekezi, be stimulated to make use of these services as to be able to run their « own » co-operatives and set up small scale enterprises.

A related proposal by M. Murekezi was the implementation of credit systems to enable beginning entrepreneurs to successfully start their business. Poor Rwandans in general and Batwa in particular could benefit from such a system, according to M. Murekezi. Without an initial starting budget, it is extremely difficult for Batwa to engage upon new initiatives.

With respect to shift the focus of Batwa from pottery to other activities, M. Murekezi elaborated on the need to provide landless Batwa with land. He specifically referred to the need to include landless Batwa as a target group in the current program of allocating and re-distribution of land, together with returning refugees, displaced persons and *1959 returnees*.

This is all the more important since, in the past, Batwa participation in animal husbandry projects proved unsuccessful, as Batwa were not able to raise the animals properly since they lacked (access to) land where to graze them.

Now, once Batwa are provided with a plot of land, it is vital to offer additional training in order that they will be able to manage as independent farmers or cattle herders. Producing crops or dairy products for the local market will enhance the economic position of the Batwa considerably, according to Mr. Murekezi.

As to make proper use of traditional Batwa knowledge and skills, it would be very worthwhile to create jobs for Batwa as forest conservationists and forest guards. As explained above, Batwa, especially the *Impunyu* (or forest Batwa, have preserved a rare sense of ecological responsibility, that should not get lost<sup>33</sup>. This kind of projects would also greatly benefit the environment.

## **RELIEF**

It is necessary that organizations involved in the distribution of relief commodities, both in Rwanda as well as in refugee camps, are aware of the presence of Batwa refugees among the refugee population. The specific needs of the Batwa, caused by the strained access to services provided by the aid organizations and the discrimination by other refugees which they have to face, should be taken into account. The UNPO mission would like to propose that international organizations include the Batwa refugees as a target group within their policies to assist vulnerable groups.

When distributing seeds, international organizations should take into account that many Batwa do not have (access) to land. The food situation of the Batwa in Rwanda is acute, but as the Batwa are no farmers, they are but little helped with seeds or hoes, unless they are allotted land also.

## **CULTURE**

Batwa traditions of dance and songs should be fostered. It seems worthwhile to support and promote the creation of cultural groups that perform on a commercial basis. The benefit of this kind of projects would be twofold : Batwa culture would be preserved and Batwa would make

a living out of their cultural heritage. Moreover, by means of this kind projects the Rwandan population will be informed of the Batwa culture.

#### **BATWA GRASS ROOTS ORGANIZATIONS**

It should be acknowledged that, at least for the moment, the Batwa community and its leadership are divided along political, regional and family lines. APB and other Batwa organizations suffered personal and material losses during the past months, and clearly need to recover from the traumatic experiences. Especially since the Batwa of Rwanda do not have a strong NGO tradition, it will take a while before reliable Batwa partner organizations for the Rwandan government, local NGOs and the international development organizations will be fully operational.

Thus, a prerequisite for many projects is the re-building of the APB and other grass roots organizations of the Batwa.

Mr. Uwiragiye, Chairman of APB, invited UNPO to assist in (re-)building the Batwa organizations, in an advisory capacity. Priority tasks that will need to be undertaken in this respect are : -the reconstruction of the APB or a similar organization ; the creation of an appropriate structure for such grass roots organization ; and the conduct of elections ; - the establishment of appropriate procedures for financial management and control ; - the development of project proposals and fund-raising for them ; and - the organization of training for program managers, financial managers and grass roots organizers.

#### **VII: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMANDATIONS**

The situation in Rwanda today is a sensitive one. The country's government is facing serious problems in re-establishing an effective civil authority, capable of maintaining law and order, providing a proper and fair judicial system and guaranteeing the respect for human rights. At the same time it must be recognised that, given the difficult conditions so soon after the genocide and war, considerable progress has already been made. This presents the Rwandans and the international community with a unique opportunity to work together to build a new Rwanda on democratic principles and capable of respecting internationally recognised human rights and freedoms. Given the declared intent of the government to do so and its request for international assistance to achieve such an aim, this opportunity should be taken and not missed. Unless the United Nations and its member states, in particular those possessing the necessary resources, develop the political will now to commit major support to the transformation and reconstruction of Rwanda, the opportunity to effect positive change in this African country will be lost. In such fields as human rights, law and order and administrative capability, criticism could be levied at sectors of the government of Rwanda and at members of the armed forces, but criticism alone will not, in the present circumstances, bring the necessary change. Only urgent, active and effective international assistance can do so. Assistance to Rwanda should, in principle, benefit all Rwandans, including the Batwa.

Because of the disadvantaged position of the Batwa in the past and their vulnerability today, however, special care must be taken by the government, international and local organizations

and NGOs working in Rwanda and in the refugee camps, to ensure equal treatment today in terms of repatriation and rehabilitation.

The work of the UNPO mission and its completion is of significant importance to the Batwa communities. No other organization is as yet attempting to ascertain the after-war situation and special needs of the Batwa, and the Batwa organizations themselves are suffering from losses and divisions caused by the war, which makes it difficult for them to undertake much meaningful activity in this field on their own.

Projects need to be developed with Batwa organizations, the government of Rwanda, Rwandan NGOs and the international community to promote and assist in the upliftment of the Batwa as should be done in the case of the other disadvantaged communities and sectors of the population, such as Rwandan women, orphaned children, single parent families, the aged and the destitute. The declared intent of the government to support and assist such initiatives is very significant and should be followed up.

The following recommendations are made in an effort to contribute to the re-building of the Rwandan society and nation, and with the awareness and understanding for the tremendous difficulties and limitations which the Government and people of Rwanda are facing today in their efforts to do the same.

#### **To the Batwa communities and organization in Rwanda :**

There is an urgent need for members of the APB and other Batwa organizations to (re-)build their organizations which were shattered by the genocide and war in Rwanda. This process must be done at grass roots level, in order to restore confidence and support of the Batwa families and communities, and in order to create a leadership which can be considered representative of the Batwa of Rwanda and which can effectively promote the people's interests.

In the process of (re-)building Batwa organizations special attention must be paid to put in place structures and mechanisms ensuring transparency in the management and full accountability and responsible management of financial resources.

Co-operation among the different Batwa organizations and communities is vital for the upliftment of the Batwa community of Rwanda. Co-ordination of activities and exchange of information, if circumstances permit also with Batwa refugees in the neighbouring countries, should be pursued vigorously. There is no reason why in a democratic and pluri-form Rwanda, several Batwa organizations could not operate alongside each other. However, as to prevent overlap and counter-productive competition, this should be done in an effective and respectful manner.

Batwa organizations should invest in developing and maintaining good relations with the government of Rwanda, and co-operate with it in developing programs and projects for the upliftment of the Batwa.

Promotion of education among the youth is of primary importance with respect to (re-)building a strong Batwa NGO movement. A serious effort must be made by the Batwa themselves and their organizations to promote the education of both boys and girls. Initiatives should be developed to encourage parents to send their children to school, and to obtain financial support where poverty is an obstacle to doing so.

### **To the Government of Rwanda :**

#### ***Human Rights and Law and order :***

The government authorities should announce and undertake prosecution and punishment of persons violating the human rights of citizens, regardless of who those persons are and what their involvement in the war and the atrocities was.

Minimal requirements of due process must be respected with regard to all persons detained under suspicion of any crime.

Special care should be taken to educate new civilian authorities, army officers and soldiers in the laws of human rights and humanitarian laws, and effective ways should be developed to ensure observance of such laws. Strengthening of discipline in the armed and police forces, especially with respect to new and young recruits will contribute to this process.

#### ***Equal treatment and Protection of Minorities :***

In carrying out the democratization of Rwanda on the principles of equality of all citizens without regard for ethnic or other background, care should be taken not to overlook the special vulnerability of a number of groups within the Rwandan society, among which are the small minority groups. Our concern in this report, of course, is focused on the Batwa communities and on individuals belonging to the Batwa minority.

In order to promote equality and equal treatment of all citizens, persons belonging to minority groups, particularly vulnerable ones, should be protected, in accordance with the internationally accepted standards of human rights law, as codified, for example, in Article 27 of the international Covenant of Civil and Political Rights, and the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination.

#### ***Upliftment of the Batwa :***

In accordance with the Rwandan government policy to give particular attention to vulnerable groups, such as women, war victims, and the very poor, special assistance should also be provided to the Batwa as a vulnerable group. Such assistance should be given in the form of promotion of broader participation in education by Batwa children, support for projects that enable Batwa families to become more self-sufficient, employment of Batwa in government departments at various levels, and promotion or organization of programs to reduce or eliminate prejudice against Batwa by other sectors of society.

### **To the international community :**

Assistance is needed in Rwanda in all fields. Now is the time to provide assistance, in order to take full advantage of the opportunity that now exists to re-build a new Rwanda along democratic lines.

#### ***Relief and development aid.***

In providing assistance, be it relief or development assistance, inside Rwanda or outside the country, it is important to pay attention to the needs of the vulnerable groups, including orphans, widows, women, children. In this context, special attention should also be given to the Batwa. Organizations should make sure that all, including the Batwa, benefit from the assistance provided, and make the required provisions to this end.

#### ***Human rights and law and Order :***

Considerable aid should be provided by the international community to the government of Rwanda in order to create and maintain a legal system and a police force capable of maintaining law and order, respecting human rights, and providing a fair and effective justice system. Such assistance should be provided in the form of financial support, technical assistance, expertise and, where necessary temporary personnel support. Until such assistance is provided, it is difficult to see how significant progress can be made in this respect.

In order to promote a realization of the Rwandan government policy of fostering unity and equality among all Rwanda citizens, attention should be paid by the NGOs, UN agencies and others working in the field, to protection of the rights of vulnerable groups, in particular the Batwa. This is important both in Rwanda and in the refugee camps outside the country.

The United Nations efforts in monitoring human rights, especially by deployment of human rights monitors should continue. It is important that organizations active in Rwanda focus on reconciliation and human rights, in order to promote a better mutual understanding between Batwa and other Rwandans and to ensure that the discrimination against Batwa is ruled out. It is suggested that more attention be given to human rights education at all levels of society.

### **VIII: SECOND PHASE OF THE UNPO BATWA PROJECT**

The report of the UNPO mission to Rwanda will be presented to and discussed with the Netherlands Ministry for Development, representatives of the Batwa community in Rwanda, the Government of Rwanda, and with local Rwandan NGOs, international organizations, UN agencies and others involved in refugee assistance, relief, repatriation and reconstruction and development programs in Rwanda.

UNPO hopes to foster interest for the case of the Batwa and to ensure that the needs of the Batwa are addressed by those who engaged upon programs and projects to re-build a peaceful and prosperous Rwanda.

## **Appendices**

- i. List of prefectures, towns, communes, sectors and cells visited by the UNPO mission.
- ii. Letters in support of the UNPO Rwanda mission by the Rwandan government and prefectural authorities.

## **I. List of prefectures, towns, communes, sectors and cells visited by the UNPO mission**

Places marked with an asterisk were not visited by the UNPO mission, but of which inhabitants were interviewed.

### **BUTARE PREFECTURE**

Butare town

Marawa commune\*

Mogasa commune\*

Ndora commune\*

Nyabisindu commune                      Nyanza sector                      Gakanyeri cell

Nyaruhengeri commune

Ntyazo commune                      Bugari sector                      Gisayura cell

Rusatira commune                      Gahana sector                      Sogwe cell

### **BYUMBA PREFECTURE**

Gituza commune                      Nyakayaga sector

Muhura commune                      Remera sector                      Nyagasozi cell

Murambi commune                      Gabiro sector                      Kabarore cell

Kiburara sector                      Nyacyonga cell

Kiramuruzi sector                      Nduba cell

Ndatemwa sector

Muvumba commune                      Karama sector                      Gatunga cell

### **GIKONGORO PREFECTURE**

Gikongoro town

Kinyamakara commune\*

Ruamiko commune\*

### **GISENYI PREFECTURE**

Gisenyi town

Kanama commune                      Kanombe sector                      Kashasha cell

### **GITARAMA PREFECTURE**

?                      Mukingo sector                      Karama cell

Gitarama town

Kayenzi commune\*

Kigoma commune                      Mpanga sector                      Nkinda cell

Ngoma sector                      Rutete cell

Ngwa sector                      Gatagara cell

Masango commune                      Kabyondo sector

Nyakoko sector                      Kabudja cell

Munanira sector                      Munanira cell

Mukingi commune                      Kamusenyi sector                      Nyarysango cell

Nyakabuye sector                      Nyarumbiro cell

Muyira commune	Mututu sector	Mahura cell
Ntongwe commune	Gikoma sector	Mwambi cell
Nyamabuye commune	Mpushi sector	
Musambira commune	Gitembe sector	Gihogwe cell
Muturingwa commune	Kiriru sector	
Runda commune	Gihara sector	Kagina cell
	Rugarika cell	
Tambwe commune	Munina sector	Kibingo cell
	Gitisi sector	Gitisi cell

**KIBUNGO PREFECTURE**

Kibungo town

**KIBUYE PREFECTURE**

Kibuye town

Mabanza commune	Nyarugenge sector	Kambogo cell
	Gibirisi sector	
	Gihara sector	

**KIGALI PREFECTURE**

Gikoro commune

Kanzenze commune

Gicaca cell	Nyakacama cell
Kanazi sector	
Marayundo sector	
Misenyi sector	

Kigali town

Musasa commune

Kayciru commune

Remera commune

Shyorongi commune

Gatagara sector	Gitonde cell
Kayciru sector	Kamatamu cell
Remera sector	

**RUHENGERI PREFECTURE**

Kinigi commune\*

Kagaka sector

**ii. Letters in support of the UNPO Rwanda Mission by the Rwandan Government and prefectural authorities**

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN

I, the undersigned, Seth Sendashonga, Minister for Interior and Communal Development, certify that the objectives and the activities of the mission to Rwanda of the UNPO are known to me and deserve to be supported. General Secretary VAN WALT VAN PRAAG Michael, UWIRAGIYE Charles, OVEREEM Pauline and ZWAAN Erica, are all members of this UNPO Mission.

I request that all necessary assistance, including where necessary security assistance, be extended to these persons to enable them to carry out their mission successfully. They may travel throughout Rwanda, including border areas, displaced persons camps, Gishwati, Nyungwe and areas which may otherwise be of interest to their mission. They can enter and leave Rwanda freely to visit neighbouring countries and should be given access to and be received by government officials, both civilian and military, community leaders and others. They are permitted to, without the need for prior authorization, collect information and freely interview any person in privacy, make recordings and take photographs for the purpose of their mission.

I look forward to hearing and discussing the findings of the mission once its research has been completed.

Kigali, November 18, 1994



Ministere de la Justice  
B:P: 160 Kigali

Monsieur le Directeur de Prison  
KIGALI  
GITARAMA  
BUTARE

Monsieur le Directeur,

Les porteurs de la présente répondant aux noms de Mesdemoiselles Pauline OVEREEN, Erica ZWAAN et Monsieur UWIRAGIYE Charles respectivement Directrice, Directrice Adjointe de l'Organisation des Nations et peuples non représentés ainsi que leur interprète, sont autorisés à visiter les Prisons de KIGALI, GITARAMA et BUTARE.

Le Ministre de la Justice

NKUBITO Alphonse Marie

## **MOVEMENT ORDER**

To whom it may concern

The following persons are authorized to visit villages within Kibuye Prefecture to intent with unrepresented peoples « TWA » and other vulnerable groups

COLIN ALFRED  
VIRGINIA MEMBREY  
JANE THOMAS  
PAULINE OVEREEN  
ERICA SWAN  
CHARLES UNIRAGIYE (guide)

Please assist them accordingly

SOLIDARITY

Kabira Asiel,  
Préfet de Préfecture Kibuye

PS : No stamp, it was stolen

Gikongoro, le 2/12/1994

Les agents de l'Organisation des Nations et Peuples non représentés sont autorisés à faire leur enquête dans la Préfecture de GIKONGORO, comme cela est autorisé par le ministre de l'Intérieur et du Développement communal.

À GIKONGORO, Félix  
Général de GIKONGORO  


## Notes

<sup>1</sup> APB : Association for the promotion of Batwa. Charles Uwiragiye was elected Executive Secretary for APB in 1992. At a General Assembly, called for by Charles Uwiragiye and Zéphyrin Karimba on December 1994, Charles Uwiragiye was elected chairman of APB.

<sup>2</sup> Batwa is the plural form used to indicate two or more people of the Twa group. Mutwa is the singular form. Compare : Batutsi and Mututsi, Bahutu and Muhutu.

<sup>3</sup> Due to security reasons, Mr. Charles Uwiragiye did not accompany the mission to Zaire and Tanzania, nor to the displaced persons camps in Gikongoro prefecture, Rwanda.

<sup>4</sup> The Rwandan administrative structure distinguishes prefectures (or provinces), communes (villages), sectors (village sub-division), cells (sector sub-divisions) and 10-houses-units (cell sub-divisions). Each administrative unit has its leader : *prefect, mayor, counsellor, responsible, and head.*

A complete list of all prefectures, towns, communes, sectors and cells visited by the mission can be found in the appendices.

<sup>5</sup> ADBR : Association for the Global Development of the Batwa of Rwanda.

<sup>6</sup> No precise figures of the population growth and/or composition of the Batwa through the years are available. According to a 1989 governmental census, there were 45.000 Batwa in Rwanda. Since then, no official census has been conducted. According to some, it is not unlikely that at that time there were even more Batwa. Since many Batwa can not afford to pay marriage taxes, their children were often not registered and did not receive identity cards. On the other hand, the APB roughly estimated that the number of Batwa was about 29.000 in 1993.

<sup>7</sup> See for additional information : *The Batwa of Rwanda in 1993*, a World Rainforest Movement report by Judith Knight and Jerome Lewis, 1993, and *Survival for tribal peoples*, a Survival International report, May 1994.

<sup>8</sup> Filip Reyntjens, *l'Afrique des Grands Lacs en crise*. Rwanda, Burundi : 1988-1994, page 25.

<sup>9</sup> AREDETTWA : Association for the Democratic Restoration of the Twa.

<sup>10</sup> APSB : Association for the Social Progress of the Batwa.

<sup>11</sup> APSD : Association for the Social Progress of the Disadvantaged.

<sup>12</sup> ADIGMAR : Association for the Integrated Development of the Marginalized Groups in Rwanda.

<sup>13</sup> Literally Interahamwe means « we fight together ». Besides the Interahamwe, members of the CDR also engaged in violent acts against the Batutsi population. The CDR supporters are sometimes referred to as *Impuzamugambi*.

<sup>14</sup> Temmerman, Els de, *De doden zijn niet dood. Rwanda, een ooggetuigeverslag*, 1994, page 65. *The Batwa of Rwanda in 1993, a World Rainforest Movement Report*, by Judith Knight and Jerome Lewis, 1993, page 18.

<sup>15</sup> ABPR : Association of Progressive Batwa of Rwanda.

<sup>16</sup> PIM, Projet Intégration Mutwa, offered training and work to some 20 Batwa youngsters.

<sup>17</sup> Fidèle Kaboyi Munyakazi (Pygasse-Zaire) and Emmanuel Kagabo (APGD-Burundi).

<sup>18</sup> Due to several reasons, the UNPO mission spent more time in Kigali, Gitarama, Butare and Byumba prefectures, than in the remaining prefectures. It is acknowledged by the UNPO mission that this might have influenced, to a certain extent, the results of the fact finding.

<sup>19</sup> In the report, as a matter of principle, no names of Batwa respondents are given, unless they are member of APB. Information on the respondents is kept at the International Secretariat of UNPO in The Hague.

<sup>20</sup> In her book, Els de Temmerman, divides the murderers and participators in the genocide in four categories ; in the first place she speaks about young, unemployed bandits, who were provided (or bought) with occupation, arms and drugs.

<sup>21</sup> African Rights report, page 252.

<sup>22</sup> African Rights report, page 257.

<sup>23</sup> CLADHO : Collectives des Ligues et Associations des Droits de l'Homme (Collective of Human Rights Leagues and Associations).

<sup>24</sup> Pygasse : Assistance aux Pygmées et Environnement (Assistance to the Pygmies and the Environment).

<sup>25</sup> A list of names of the killed Batwa was provided, including : Mr. Albert Ntuzikwera, Mr. Rwakabwa, Mr. Viateur Karimundo, Mr. Rutamusungiweho, Mr. Jean Havugimana, Ms. Mukamana (aged 12), Mr. Hajabagika, Mr. Munjakaringa and Mr. Rusati.

<sup>26</sup> Pygasse and Seipy (Santé et Education pour tous et Intégration des Pygmées (Health and Education for all and Integration of the Pygmies).

<sup>27</sup> Munyakazi claimed that the 1900 registered Batwa refugees in Zaire, had together lost about 1400 relatives in the violence of the war.

<sup>28</sup> Godding ventured the opinion that the Batwa who were targeted by the Interahamwe could have been mistaken for Batutsi. As a result of mixed marriages Batwa sometimes look more like Batutsi than like Batwa, according to Godding.

<sup>29</sup> PIDP : Projet d'Intégration et de Développement des Pygmées (Project for the Integration and Development of Pygmies).

<sup>30</sup> Transit camps in/around Bukavu : 189 families ; Kalehe refugee camp : 12 families ; Idjwi Island : 8 families ; Kamayola refugee camp : 30 families.

<sup>31</sup> APGD : Association pour la Promotion des Groupes Demunis (Association for the Promotion of Vulnerable Groups).

<sup>32</sup> ACIST : African Community Initiatives Support Teams.

<sup>33</sup> World Rainforest Movement Report, page 18.